

NOT THE IMPOSSIBLE FAITH

**Why Christianity Didn't
Need a Miracle
to Succeed**

by

Richard C. Carrier, Ph.D.

Endnotes for the Visually Impaired



2009

Introduction

¹ The tactics, behavior, and (in my opinion) incompetence of J.P. Holding as a scholar are documented on a website devoted entirely to collecting complaints and analyses from people who have dealt with him before: “Tektonics Exposed! A Collection of Essays and Debates Highlighting the Depraved Apologetics of J.P. Holding, a.k.a. Robert Turkel” ([the-anointed-one.com](http://the-anointed-one.com/exposed.html), esp. [/exposed.html](http://the-anointed-one.com/exposed.html)).

² J.P. Holding, “The Impossible Faith: Or, How Not to Start an Ancient Religion” (Tekton Apologetics Ministries: n.d.): www.tektonics.org/lp/nowayjose.html.

³ All my quotations of J.P. Holding are from his online articles (cited in Notes 2 and 6) as they appeared in 2004, and not from his book (hence no page numbers will be given).

⁴ My generous benefactor was the pseudonymous Johnny Skeptic (johnnyskeptic.com), who wanted a professional scholar to give J.P. Holding's argument a thorough review and critique, and was willing to fund exactly that. Briefer critiques had been written by Bob Price ("James Patrick Holding's *The Impossible Faith*," www.robertmprice.mindvendor.com/rev_holding.htm) and Brian Holtz ("The Not-So-Impossible Faith," *The Secular Web*: 2002, www.infidels.org/library/modern/brian_holtz/impossible_faith.html).

⁵ Richard Carrier, "Was Christianity Too Improbable to be False?" (*The Secular Web*: 2004, 2006, rights to the electronic version owned in part by the Secular Web): www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/improbable.

⁶ J.P. Holding, "Broken Vector Sinks Again: Or, TIF Vindicated" (Tekton Apologetics Ministries: 2004): www.tektonics.org/lp/no_wayjose_CC2.html.

⁷ See Robert Shmerling, "The Real Dangers of Lightning" (Aetna IntelliHealth.com: 2001). I've discussed these problems of relative probability before, in Richard Carrier, "Probability of Survival vs. Miracle: Assessing the Odds," in Part 2 of my somewhat outdated essay collection "Why I Don't Buy the Resurrection Story" (*The Secular Web*: 5th ed., 2004): www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/resurrection/2.html.

⁸ I will discuss Bayes' Theorem and its application to historical method in considerable detail in my forthcoming book *On the Historicity of Jesus Christ*, and more briefly in a chapter in the forthcoming anthology *Sources of the Jesus Tradition*. But the best example I've seen of a practical discussion of Bayes' Theorem in contexts related to historical analysis is Douglas Hunter, *Political [and] Military Applications of Bayesian Analysis: Methodological Issues* (1984). For a more recent but highly technical discussion see Giulio Agostini, *Bayesian Reasoning in Data Analysis: A Critical Introduction* (2003).

¹ Samuel Noah Kramer, "The First Tale of Resurrection," *History Begins at Sumer: Thirty-Nine Firsts in Man's Recorded History*, 3rd ed. (1981): pp. 154-67. For more on Inanna, Tammuz, and (as we shall see) Adonis, and Attis, see: G. Sfameni Gasparro, *Soteriology and Mystic Aspects in the Cult of Cybele and Attis* (1997); Diane Wolkstein, *Inanna, Queen of Heaven and Earth: Her Stories and Hymns from Sumer* (1983); Eugene Lane, *Cybele, Attis and Related Cults: Essays in Memory of M. J. Vermaseren* (1996) and M. J. Vermaseren, *Cybele and Attis: The Myth and the Cult* (1977); Betty De Shong Meador, *Lady of Largest Heart: Poems of the Sumerian High Priestess Enheduanna* (2001).

² *Apostolic Constitutions* 5.12.

³ Origen, *Selecta in Ezechielem*, in J.-P. Migne, *Patrologiae Cursus Completus: Series Graeca* 13:800.

⁴ See my critical comments in Richard Carrier, "Kersey Graves and *The World's Sixteen Crucified Saviors*" (The Secular Web: 2003): www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/graves.html. For a good comparative study see Hans-Josef Klauck, *The Religious Context of Early Christianity: A Guide to Graeco-Roman Religions* (2000).

⁵ For the many alternative explanations of this discrepancy in the predicted timing of Jesus' death and resurrection see Evan Fales, "Taming the Tehom: The Sign of Jonah in Matthew," *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, ed. by Robert M. Price and Jeffery Jay Lowder (2005): pp. 307-48.

⁶ As I argue in Richard Carrier, "The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb," in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, ed. by Robert M. Price and Jeffery Jay Lowder (2005): pp. 158-61.

⁷ Joshua 8:29 and 10:26-27; 1 Samuel 31:10; 2 Samuel 4:12; Ezekiel 16:39-40; Esther 9:13-14; Lamentations 5:12; and of course: Genesis 40:19-22.

⁸ Deuteronomy 21:22-23; Code of Hammurabi § 21, 153, 227.

⁹ On ancient prostitutes, see: Catharine Edwards, "Unspeakable Professions: Public Performance and Prostitution in Ancient

Rome," in *Roman Sexualities*, ed. J. Hallett and M. Skinner (1997) and Sarah Pomeroy, *Goddesses, Whores, Wives, and Slaves: Women in Classical Antiquity* (1995). On ancient slavery: Thomas Wiedemann, *Greek and Roman Slavery* (1981) and Alan Watson, *Roman Slave Law* (1987). On gladiators: Thomas Wiedemann, *Emperors and Gladiators* (1995) and Michael Grant, *Gladiators* (1967).

¹⁰ On ancient Attis-Cybele cult, see references in note 1 above and: Robert Turcan, "The Great Mother and Her Eunuchs," *The Cults of the Roman Empire*, 2nd ed. (1996): pp. 28-74; Mary Beard, et al., *Religions of Rome: Volume 1, A History* (1998): pp. 164-66.

¹¹ This quote comes from Seneca's lost work *On Superstition*, written before 65 A.D., but quoted by Augustine in *City of God* 6.10. Augustine makes implausible excuses for the fact that Seneca never mentions Christianity, even though Seneca attacks every conceivable cult in this work, including Judaism (6.11). Seneca might not have mentioned it because he had never heard of it—meaning the book had to have been written before the persecution of 64 A.D., and may well have been written as early as the year 40 (the beginning of Seneca's known literary career).

¹² *Theodosian Code* 16.10.13.

¹³ On the government's Christianization of the Empire, see: Bill Leadbetter, "From Constantine to Theodosius (and Beyond)," *The Early Christian World*, ed. Philip Esler (2000): vol. 1, pp. 258-92 (Theodosius: 285-87).

¹⁴ See Ramsay MacMullen, *Christianity & Paganism in the Fourth to Eighth Centuries* (1997) and David Frankfurter, *Religion in Roman Egypt: Assimilation and Resistance* (1998). For political and administrative context, see Averil Cameron, *The Later Roman Empire: AD 284-430* (1993) and A. H. M. Jones, *The Later Roman Empire 284-602: A Social, Economic, and Administrative Survey*, 2 vols. (1964).

¹⁵ This is gleefully detailed by Mark the Deacon, *Life of Porphyry, Bishop of Gaza*. See Ramsay MacMullen, *Christianizing the Roman Empire: A.D. 100-400* (1984): pp. 86-89; and Robert Grant, *Early Christianity and Society: Seven Studies* (1977): pp. 9-11.

¹⁶ Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 18.116-19; Mark 11:29-32; etc.

¹⁷ Matthew 14:1-2; Mark 6:12-16, 8:27-28; Luke 9:18-19.

¹⁸ For example, see 1 and 2 Maccabees (and also Daniel 11:33-35 & 12:3). Disgust at the murder of righteous men by those in power is certainly a complaint voiced by early Christians, quoting the rebuke of Elijah: e.g. Luke 11:47, Acts 7:52; 1 Thessalonians 2:15, Romans 11:3, drawing on 1 Kings 19:10. See Alan Segal's discussion of the social context of early Jewish martyrology in his *Life after Death: A History of the Afterlife in Western Religion* (2004): pp. 285-321. For more on the socio-cultural causes of this reverence for martyrs, see Chapter 8.

¹⁹ Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 12.255-56.

²⁰ See: Mary Beard, et al., *Religions of Rome: Volume 2, A Sourcebook* (1998): § 2.10b: pp. 57-58; and E. Dinkler, *Signum Crucis* (1967). Archaeologically, the wall the graffito was cut into did not exist in the 1st century or the early 2nd, and the carving is most likely associated with activity there in the early 3rd century.

²¹ I will discuss the evidence for this in Chapter 18, but the case is adequately presented in David Horrell, "Early Jewish Christianity" and Thomas Finn, "Mission and Expansion," both in *The Early Christian World*, ed. Philip Esler (2000): vol. 1, pp. 136-67 & 295-315 (respectively).

²² On Jewish sympathizers in general, see Margaret Williams, "VII.2. Pagans Sympathetic to Judaism" and "VII.3. Pagan Converts to Judaism" in *The Jews Among the Greeks and Romans: A Diasporan Sourcebook* (1998): pp. 163-79.

²³ On the later forgery of writings by this Dionysius see "Dionysius the Pseudo-Areopagite" in the *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, 3rd ed. (1997): p. 485. On the office he held see "Areopagus" and "zeugitai" in the *Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (1996): pp. 151-52 & 1636 (respectively).

²⁴ As catalogued, for example, in "Major Events in Japanese History" (www2.kanawa.com/japan/history.html).

²⁵ See Richard Carrier, “Osiris and Pagan Resurrection Myths: Assessing the Till-McFall Exchange” (2002): [at www.frontline-apologetics.com/Carrier_on_Osiris_.html] and John Griffiths, *The Origins of Osiris and His Cult*, 2nd ed. (1980) and *Plutarch’s De Iside et Osiride* (1970). On his death and resurrection: Plutarch, *On Isis and Osiris* 12.355d-19.358e (written near the end of the 1st century); Apuleius, *Metamorphoses* 11.27-30 (early 2nd century); Seneca, *On Superstition*, via Augustine, *City of God* 6.10 (see earlier note).

²⁶ Sealed tomb or casket: Plutarch, *On Isis and Osiris* 13.356b-d (called a “burial” at 42.368a); compare Matthew 27:66. Number of conspirators: Plutarch, id.; the Sanhedrin who condemned Christ consisted of seventy-one men (per Mishnah Law, *Sanhedrin* 1.5 & 1.6) and Judas makes seventy-two. Third day: Plutarch, id. & 39.366e-f; compare 1 Corinthians 15:4, and in every story Jesus always dies on a Friday and rises on a Sunday (which is the third day, since in antiquity days were counted inclusively). Full moon: Plutarch, *On Isis and Osiris* 42.367e-f; all stories have Jesus dying on or within a day of the Passover, which always occurs during a full moon. See my discussion of these details in my online FAQ for *The Empty Tomb* (www.richardcarrier.info/SpiritualFAQ.html#osiris-parallel).

²⁷ Plutarch, *Romulus* 27-28 (late 1st century) and the pre-Christian author Livy, *From the Founding of the City* 1.16.2-7 (written c. 15 B.C.); also Cicero, *Laws* 1.3, *Republic* 2.10 (c. 40 B.C.); Ovid, *Fasti* 2.491-512 (c. 10 A.D.); Dionysius of Halicarnassus, *Roman Antiquities* 2.63.3 (c. 10 B.C.); Tertullian, *Apology* 21 (c. 200 A.D.).

²⁸ Orpheus: Apollodorus, *Library* 1.3.2. Bacchus: Justin Martyr, *Dialogue of Justin and Trypho the Jew* 69-70.

²⁹ Cf. 1 Corinthians 15:49-54, 2 Corinthians 5:2-4; Origen, *Contra Celsum* 7.32; *Gospel of Phillip* 57.(23); *Ascension of Isaiah* 9.9-18. See Dale Martin, *The Corinthian Body* (1995): p. 109 and Richard Carrier, “The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb,” in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, ed. by Robert M. Price and Jeffery Jay Lowder (2005): pp. 119, 132-33, 134, 140-41.

³⁰ Isaiah 49:7; that this was a messianic prophecy is clear from the context (Isaiah 49:1-13). See, also, Psalms 89:38-45 (which is specifically about “the Christ” being shamed and maltreated).

³¹ Isaiah 53:9 (which also says the messiah will be “with a rich man in his death,” a plausible basis for having a rich man bury him in Mark’s narrative) and 53:12; Mark 15:28.

³² Isaiah 50:4-9, 52:7-53:12.

³³ Psalms 22:1, 6-7. That this Psalm forms a model for Mark’s crucifixion narrative is clear to anyone who compares the two, e.g. compare Psalms 22:8-18 with elements in Mark 15.

³⁴ *Wisdom of Solomon* 2:12-22 & 5:1-8, 5:15-23.

³⁵ See relevant discussion in Richard Carrier, “The Burial of Jesus in Light of Jewish Law,” *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, ed. by Robert M. Price and Jeffery Jay Lowder (2005): pp. 375-79.

³⁶ Daniel 9:26.

³⁷ Suetonius, *Life of Vespasian* 4.

³⁸ Josephus, *Jewish War* 6.312-16.

³⁹ Tacitus, *Histories* 5.13.

⁴⁰ Julius Africanus, *Chronology* § 18.2 (via George Syncellus).

⁴¹ *Wisdom of Solomon* 2:12-3:3.

⁴² See H.W. Parke, *Sibyls and Sibylline Prophecy in Classical Antiquity* (1989) and D.S. Potter, *Prophets and Emperors: Human and Divine Authority from Augustus to Theodosius* (1994); as well as Robin Lane Fox, “Language of the Gods,” *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 168-261.

¹ See Todd Klutz, “Paul and the Development of Gentile Christianity” and Jeffrey Siker, “Christianity in the Second and Third Centuries,” in *The Early Christian World*, vol. 1, ed. Philip Esler (2000): pp. 168-97 (esp. p. 193) and 231-57 (esp. pp. 232-35), respectively.

On Paul’s criticisms of his fellow Jews (which paralleled those of other Jewish radicals, such as the community at Qumran), see Daniel Boyarin, *A Radical Jew: Paul and the Politics of Identity* (1997) and Alan Segal, *Paul the Convert: The Apostolate and Apostasy of Saul the Pharisee* (1992)

On the separation of Christianity from Judaism and its corresponding development of anti-Semitism, see: John Gager, *The Origins of Anti-Semitism: Attitudes Toward Judaism in Pagan and Christian Antiquity* (1985); Peter Schafer, *Judeophobia: Attitudes Toward the Jews in the Ancient World* (1997); William Farmer, *Anti-Judaism and the Gospels* (1999); Magnus Zetterholm, *The Formation of Christianity in Antioch: A Social-Scientific Approach to the Separation between Judaism and Christianity* (2003).

² For example, see Galatians 3:28; Colossians 3:15 (w. 3:16-4:6); Ephesians 2:11-19, 4:1-6; and Romans 2:10-11 (indeed, the entirety of Romans chs. 12 and 13).

³ On all these facts, the evidence is thoroughly documented by Robert Turcan, *The Cults of the Roman Empire*, 2nd ed. (1996), and Mary Beard, et al., *Religions of Rome: Volume 1, A History* and *Religions of Rome: Volume 2, A Sourcebook* (1998).

⁴ Michael Rodkinson, "The Generations of the Tanaim: First Generation" in *The Babylonian Talmud* (1918): www.sacred-texts.com/jud/t10/ht202.htm; and "Hillel and Shammai" in the *Jewish Virtual Library* (2004): www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/biography/hillel.html.

⁵ b.Talmud, *Shabbat* 31a.

⁶ Mishnah, *Abot* 2.2a-b.

⁷ Rabbinical proverb: b.Gemara 29a. Pagan proverb: Xenophon, *Economics* 20.15.

⁸ Mishnah, *Abot* 1.10b.

⁹ Mishnah, *Qiddushin* 4.14l.

¹⁰ Philo (a Jewish philosopher contemporary with Paul), via Eusebius, *Preparation of Gospel* 8.11.5-12. See also: s.v. "Essenes," *Encyclopedia Judaica* (1971): vol. 6, pp. 899-902; *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, 3rd ed. (1997): p. 562; *Encyclopedia of the Dead Sea Scrolls* (2000): vol. 1, pp. 262-69. Sources describe as many as six different factions of Essenes, each with slightly different beliefs.

In addition, the ancient Therapeutae were probably a faction of the Essenes as well. See: s.v. "Therapeutae," *Encyclopedia Judaica* (1971): vol. 15, pp. 1111-12; *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, 3rd ed. (1997): p. 1608; *Encyclopedia of the Dead Sea Scrolls*, (2000): vol. 2, pp. 943-46. Eusebius found the Therapeutae so similar to Christians that he mistook them as an early Christian sect in his *History of the Church* 2.17.

Many scholars believe the Qumran community was a faction of the Essenes. See s.v. "Dead Sea sect," *Encyclopedia Judaica* (1971): vol. 5, pp. 1408-09. Some Roman elites regarded this

counter-cultural community at Qumran with at least a little respect: Pliny, *Natural History* 5.73, and Dio Chrysostom, via Synesius, *Dio* 3.2. Finally, for some online guidance, see Sid Green, "From Which Religious Sect Did Jesus Emerge?" (The Secular Web: 2001): www.infidels.org/library/modern/features/2001/green1.html.

¹¹ In my forthcoming book *The Scientist in the Early Roman Empire*, I will discuss this and other evidence, as well as scholarship, on the distinctions in values and status between lower, middle, and upper classes in ancient Roman society.

¹² Diogenes Laertius, *Lives and Opinions of Eminent Philosophers* 2.5.18, from the early 3rd century but citing pre-Christians sources (e.g. 2.5.19, 2.5.20-21).

¹³ See Ramsay MacMullen, *Roman Social Relations* (1974): pp. 70-80. See also Ethele Brewster, *Roman Craftsmen and Tradesmen of the Early Empire* (1917), whose work was updated by Alison Burford, *Craftsmen in Greek and Roman Society* (1972).

¹⁴ Publius Licinius Philonicus & Publius Licinius Demetrius (near Rome, c. 20 B.C.), stone now on display at the British Museum (photo by Richard Carrier).

¹⁵ See the relevant entries in *The Dictionary of Classical Mythology* (1951). In Chapter 9 I discuss how Jews would respond to the idea of an incarnated god who became an ordinary rabbi.

¹⁶ Arnobius, *Adversus Nationes* 3.20.1.

¹⁷ Personal e-mail communication of 15 April 2005.

¹⁸ Still, even though it is a completely different issue, I propose my own answer to the question of why that *kerygma* was adopted to sell this social message in Richard Carrier, "Whence Christianity? A Meta-Theory for the Origins of Christianity," *Journal of Higher Criticism* 11.1 (Spring 2005): 22-34. I will develop this further in my forthcoming book *On the Historicity of Jesus Christ*.

¹⁹ On the sect of Galileans: Hegesippus, quoted by Eusebius, *History of the Church* 4.22.7; and Justin Martyr, *Dialogue of Justin and Trypho the Jew* 80. On the Social and Mithradatic Wars, see

“Social War” and “Mithradates (VI)” in the *Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (1996).

²⁰ See: “Nazareth” in *Archaeological Encyclopedia of the Holy Land*, ed. Avraham Negev & Shimon Gibson, new ed. (2001).

²¹ See B. Bagatti, *Excavations in Nazareth* (1969), esp. vol. 1, pp. 170-71 & 233-34.

I’ve heard some claim that the Gospel description of the town as built on a hill (Luke 4:29) is factually incorrect, but I’ve confirmed from photographs and archaeological reports that Nazareth was indeed built down the slope of a hill, and many of its houses, storerooms, and tombs were cut from the rock of that hill. The “brow” of that hill would likely have even been cut or built up to provide a suitable place for hurling the condemned as required of every town under Mishnah law (*Sanhedrin* 6.4).

²² Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 18.27 & 18.36-37; *Jewish War* 2.167-68.

²³ Josephus, *Life* 228-35, 340-46, 390-93; *Jewish War* 2.585, 2.590-94.

²⁴ Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 20.38-48.

²⁵ Josephus, *Jewish War* 2.95, 3.44; *Life* 340-46; *Jewish Antiquities* 18.116-19. And see “John the Baptist” in *Eerdmans Dictionary of the Bible* (2000) with corresponding maps.

²⁶ Richard Rohrbaugh, “The Jesus Tradition: The Gospel Writers’ Strategies of Persuasion,” *The Early Christian World*, vol. 1, ed. Philip Esler (2000): pp. 198-30 (quote from pp. 218-19; Gospel of John discussed: pp. 218-22).

For the situation in modern America, see Richard Hofstadter, *Anti-Intellectualism in American Life* (1963) and Susan Jacoby, *The Age of American Unreason* (2008).

²⁷ See: Michael Grant, “The Poor” in *Greeks and Romans: A Social History* (1992): pp. 59-82; C.R. Whittaker, “The Poor in the City of Rome” in *Land, City and Trade in the Roman Empire* (1993): VII.1-25; and P.A. Brunt, *Social Conflicts in the Roman Republic* (1971).

For a discussion of this point in connection with early Christianity, see: Richard Horsley, *Jesus and Empire: The Kingdom of God and the New World Disorder* (2002); Rodney Stark, *The Rise of Christianity* (1996): pp. 147-62; Bruce Malina, *The Social Gospel of Jesus* (2001): pp. 26-35, 104-11.

²⁸ Bruce Malina & Richard Rohrbaugh, *Social-Science Commentary on the Gospel of John* (1998): p. 7 (quoting Halliday); cf. “John’s Antisociety,” *ibid.*: pp. 9-11.

²⁹ See “Nazarene” in *Eerdmans Dictionary of the Bible* (2000).

³⁰ Matthew 4:12-16, citing Isaiah 8:21-9:2.

³¹ Justin Martyr, *Apology* 1.33 (Perseus: 1.22, 1.54, and in the *Dialogue of Justin with Trypho the Jew* 67).

³² See Richard Carrier, “The Problem of the Virgin Birth Prophecy” (The Secular Web: 2003): www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/virginprophecy.shtml.

³³ See “Immaculate Conception” in *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, 3rd ed. (1997): pp. 821-22.

¹ This quote and that of Eudemus are preserved by the Roman historian Diogenes Laertius in *Lives of Eminent Philosophers* 1.9 (3rd century A.D.). That Theopompus said this is also corroborated from the 6th century by Aeneas of Gaza in *Theophrastus* 72. Despite a few skeptics, most scholars now agree the Jews got the idea from the Persians: see the summary of modern scholarship in John Hinnells, *Zoroastrian and Parsi Studies* (2000), esp. pp. 29-92.

² That Daniel is a forgery is almost universally accepted by scholars today. For example, see “Daniel, Book of” in *Eerdmans Dictionary of the Bible* (2000), and Curt van den Heuvel’s online survey of the facts in “Revealing Daniel” (2Think: 1998): www.2think.org/daniel/.

2think.org/hundredsheep/bible/comment/daniel.shtml.

³ Again, for instance, see “Isaiah, book of” in *Eerdmans Dictionary of the Bible* (2000).

⁴ The best recent treatments of this aspect of Zoroastrian belief throughout Western history is provided by Alan Segal, “Iranian Views of the Afterlife and Ascent to the Heavens,” *Life after Death: A History of the Afterlife in Western Religion* (2004): pp. 173-203; Albert De Jong, *Traditions of the Magi: Zoroastrianism in Greek and Latin Literature* (1997), as well as “Shadow and Resurrection,” *Bulletin of the Asia Institute* 9 (1995): pp. 215-24; and Mary Boyce, *A History of Zoroastrianism*, vol. 3 (1975): esp. pp. 367-68 and 392-440.

⁵ Besides what follows, for an updated analysis of a select few examples of pagan beliefs about their own resurrected gods see Tryggve Mettinger, *The Riddle of Resurrection: “Dying and Rising Gods” in the Ancient Near East* (2001) and “The Dying and Rising God: The Peregrinations of a Mytheme,” in *Ethnicity in Ancient Mesopotamia*, ed. W.H. van Soldt (2005): pp. 198-210.

⁶ Herodotus, *Histories* 4.94-96 & 4.13-16 (also in Apollonius, *Miraculous Stories* 2.2); Lucian, *Lover of Lies* 26. I have also discussed the issue of pagan resurrection beliefs in the “Main Argument” of Richard Carrier, “Why I Don’t Buy the Resurrection Story,” 6th ed. (The Secular Web: 2006): www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/resurrection/lecture.html; and in Richard Carrier, “Osiris and Pagan Resurrection Myths: Assessing the Till-McFall Exchange” (Frontline Apologetics: 2002): www.frontline-apologetics.com/Carrier_on_Osiris_.html. The belief that worshippers of Zalmoxis, “King and God,” obtain immortality is attested in Plato, *Charmides* 156d (Zalmoxis and his followers were also noted healers: *ibid.* 156e-158b). The sources and sociological background for the Zalmoxis cult is excellently surveyed by Mircea Eliade in *Zalmoxis the Vanishing God* (1970).

⁷ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 2.55, 3.26, 3.22. Celsus didn’t believe in resurrection only because he was an Epicurean (who, per 4.36 & 4.57, sometimes also adopted a Platonic point of view for his fictional critics of Christianity, cf. 1.8 & 4.75; note also Lucian, *Alexander the Quack Prophet* 1-3, 60-61).

⁸ Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 2.5.17.

⁹ See Apollodorus, *Library* 1.3.2 & 1.9.15.

¹⁰ Euripides, *Alcestris* (see esp. lines 1115-61; notably, once risen from the grave, she could not speak “until purified in the sight of the nether gods on the third day,” 1144-49).

¹¹ Plutarch, *Theseus* 35.4-36.2. He calls it a *phasma*, “ghost,” yet still a demigod, so Plutarch probably thought Theseus had appeared in a numinous divine body instead of his original body (which was still buried: Plutarch, *Cimon* 8.5-6).

¹² Pausanias, *Description of Greece* 1.15.3 The legend is discussed by Robert Garland, *Introducing New Gods: The Politics of Athenian Religion* (1992): pp. 82-98; and Emily Kearns, *The Heroes of Attica* (1989): pp. 120-4. That the “resurrection” of Theseus appeared in Athenian art within 30 years of the event: see J. Neils & S. Woodford, *Lexicon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae* 7.1 (1994): pp. 922-51; and H. A. Shapiro, *Art and Cult under the Tyrants in Athens* (1989): pp. 143-49.

¹³ On Hercules ascending in his “divine” body while leaving the mortal part of his body behind, see: Lucian, *Hermotimus* 7, which must be read in the context provided by Dale Martin, *The Corinthian Body* (1995): pp. 3-37, w. 115-17, 127-28; and Jean-Pierre Vernant, “Mortals and Immortals: The Body of the Divine,” *Mortals and Immortals: Collected Essays* (1991): pp. 27-49. I argue this is how Jesus was originally thought to have risen, in Richard Carrier, “The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb,” in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, eds. Jeff Lowder & Bob Price (2005): pp. 105-232; cf. also Richard Carrier & Jake O’Connell, “On Paul’s Theory of Resurrection: The Carrier-O’Connell Debate” (The Secular Web: 2008): www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/carrier-oconnell.

Many scholars more or less agree with me on this, e.g.: James Tabor, “Leaving the Bones Behind: A Resurrected Jesus Tradition with an *Intact* Tomb” in *Sources of the Jesus Tradition: An Inquiry* (forthcoming); Bruce Chilton, *Rabbi Paul: An Intellectual Biography* (2004): pp. 57-58; Peter Lampe, “Paul’s Concept of a Spiritual Body” in *Resurrection: Theological and Scientific Assessments* (2002), ed. Ted Peters et al.: pp. 103-14; Gregory Riley, *Resurrection Reconsidered: Thomas and John in Controversy*

(1995); Dale Martin, *The Corinthian Body* (1995); Adela Collins, "The Empty Tomb in the Gospel According to Mark" in *Hermes and Athena: Biblical Exegesis and Philosophical Theology* (1993), ed. Eleonore Stump & Thomas Flint: pp. 107-40; C.F. Moule, "St. Paul and Dualism: The Pauline Conception of the Resurrection," *New Testament Studies* 12 (1966): 106-23. Even N.T. Wright concedes it's a possibility in *The Resurrection of the Son of God* (2003): p. 367.

¹⁴ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 3.24; Justin Martyr, *Dialogue of Justin and Trypho the Jew* 69. For attestations to Asclepius as both *resurrected* and *resurrector*, see Edelstein & Edelstein, eds., *Asclepius: Collection and Interpretation of the Testimonies* (1945): esp. §66-93, §232-56 (and §382-91, §443-54).

¹⁵ Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 29.1.3.

¹⁶ Aelius Aristides, *Funeral Address in Honor of Alexander* 32.25.

¹⁷ Lucian, *Lover of Lies* 13; Apuleius, *Florida* 15, *Metamorphoses* 2.28, *Florida* 19 (with a story also mentioned in Pliny, *Natural History* 26.8; and Celsus, *On Medicine* 2.6.15); Philostratus, *Life of Apollonius of Tyana* 4.45 (the author expresses uncertainty whether she was really dead, but this proves he did not rule it out); Heraclides of Pontus, via Diogenes Laertius, *Lives of Eminent Philosophers* 8.61, 8.67 (another account of this resurrection appears in Apollonius, *Miraculous Stories* 2.1). Proclus reports on Euryonous and Rufus in his Commentary on Plato's *Republic* 2.115-16, for which I quote the translation of William Hansen, *Phlegon of Tralles' Book of Marvels* (1996): pp. 199-200.

¹⁸ Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 7.176-179. **Er:** Plato, *Republic* 614b. **Bouplagus & Lady Philinnion:** Phlegon, *De Mirabilibus* 3 & 1 (Lady Philinnion is also reported in Proclus, *Commentary on Plato's Republic* 2.115-16). **Aridaeus:** Plutarch, *On the Delayed Vengeance of the Gods* 563b-568a. **Timarchus:** Plutarch, *On the Sign of Socrates* 590a-592e.

¹⁹ Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 25.5.14 (Tylon and others); Hyginus, *Fables* 136 (Glaucus); Diodorus Siculus, *Historical Library* 1.25.6 (Isis resurrecting Horus).

²⁰ Suetonius, *Nero* 57; Tacitus, *Histories* 1.2, 2.8; Augustine, *City of God* 20.19; and some allusions in book 5 of the *Sibylline Oracles*.

²¹ Like Polites in Pausanias, *Description of Greece* 6.6.7-11, or Polycritus in Phlegon, *De Mirabilibus* 2 and Proclus, *Commentary on Plato's Republic* 2.115-16.

²² G.W. Bowersock, *Fiction as History: Nero to Julian* (1994). See also n. 39 in the "Main Argument" of Richard Carrier, "Why I Don't Buy the Resurrection Story," 6th ed. (The Secular Web: 2006): www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/resurrection/lecture.html.

²³ Petronius, *Satyricon* 140.frg.2; Plutarch, *On the Cleverness of Animals* 973e-974a.

²⁴ See Ezekiel 33:21 and 37:5-14.

²⁵ Robert Zaehner, *The Dawn and Twilight of Zoroastrianism* (1961): pp. 20-21.

²⁶ *Ibid.*: pp. 58.

²⁷ *Ibid.*: pp. 316.

²⁸ Edwin Yamauchi, *Persia and the Bible* (1990); Jan Bremmer, *The Rise and Fall of the Afterlife* (2002).

²⁹ Edwin Yamauchi, *Persia and the Bible* (1990): p. 458.

³⁰ Jan Bremmer, *The Rise and Fall of the Afterlife* (2002): p. 50.

³¹ *Ibid.*: p. 48.

³² *Ibid.*: p. 49.

³³ *Ibid.*: p. 46.

³⁴ Josephus, *Jewish War* 2.163.

³⁵ Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 18.14.

³⁶ Josephus, *Life* 12, *Jewish War* 3.372-75, *Against Apion* 2.218.

³⁷ Jan Bremmer, *The Rise and Fall of the Afterlife* (2002): p. 47.

³⁸ Mary Boyce, *A History of Zoroastrianism*, vol. 1 (1975): pp. 325-30.

³⁹ Plutarch, *On the Delay of Divine Vengeance* 24.564d. His source appears to be a lost work by a certain Protogenes (cf. *ibid.* 22.563e).

⁴⁰ *Ibid.* 23.563f and 25.565a (and ff.).

⁴¹ Plutarch, *On the Face that Appears in the Orb of the Moon* 19.932c-d and 28.943d-e.

⁴² Plutarch, *Greek Questions* 39.300c.

⁴³ Polybius, *Histories* 16.12.7.

⁴⁴ Pausanias, *Description of Greece* 8.38.6.

⁴⁵ Albert De Jong, "Shadow and Resurrection," *Bulletin of the Asia Institute* 9 (1995): pp. 215-24.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*: pp. 216-18.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*: pp. 219-20.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*: p. 220.

⁴⁹ Waking up from an apparent death: Pseudo-Aristotle, *De Mirabilibus Auscultationibus* 839a. Revival of a corpse: Phlegon, *De Mirabilibus* 3 (which says "*anestê ho Bouplagos ek tôn nekrôn*," "Bouplagus rose from the dead," the exact same terminology employed by Christians for Jesus).

⁵⁰ See: Hebrews 11:35; Mark 5:42, 6:14-16; Matthew 9:25; Luke 8:55, 9:7-8; Acts 14:19-20.

⁵¹ I demonstrate this point in Richard Carrier, "The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb," in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, eds. Jeff Lowder & Bob Price (2005): pp. 105-232.

⁵² As is well argued in the works cited in n. 13 above. See also Richard Carrier, "Osiris and Pagan Resurrection Myths: Assessing the Till-McFall Exchange" (Frontline Apologetics: 2002): www.frontline-apologetics.com/Carrier_on_Osiris_.html.

⁵³ Aeschylus, *Eumenides* 648.

⁵⁴ Lucian, *De Saltatione* 45.

⁵⁵ Plotinus, *Enneads* 3.6.6.

⁵⁶ See 1 Corinthians 15:12-20.

⁵⁷ In 1 Corinthians 15:35-54, 2 Corinthians 4:16-5:10, and Romans 7:18-8:18.

⁵⁸ Dale Martin, *The Corinthian Body* (1995): pp. 107-08 (he also demonstrates the popularity of the resurrection of corpses among pagan commoners: pp. 111-12, 122-23). The same conclusion is reached, from different evidence and angles, in Gregory Riley, *Resurrection Reconsidered: Thomas and John in Controversy* (1995) and Stanley Porter, "Resurrection, the Greeks and the New Testament" in *Resurrection*, eds. Stanley Porter, Michael Hayes and David Tombs (1999): pp. 52-81. On popular funerary beliefs, see Caroline Bynum, *Resurrection of the Body in Western Christianity: 200-1336* (1995): pp. 45-47, 48, 51-58.

⁵⁹ Colossians 3:11 (possibly co-written by Paul).

⁶⁰ Paul's views would theoretically be reflected in 1 Timothy 2:12-14 (though this was forged almost a century after Paul's time) and 1 Corinthians 15:22, 45-50 (which is definitely from Paul). The pastoral forgery reflects views close to what Paul appears to express in 1 Cor. 14:34-25, but scholars still debate whether that passage is also a forgery (interpolated). For Bynum's analysis of later views see Caroline Bynum, *Resurrection of the Body in Western Christianity: 200-1336* (1995): pp. 26-27. Jerome's remark appears in his *Epistles* 84.6. Similar sentiments were echoed in Tertullian, *De Pallio* 3-4 and *Didascalia* 19 (cf. 1-12), etc. For discussion, see Bynum, op. cit.: pp. 90-91, 99-100.

⁶¹ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 3.35.

⁶² As already noted, e.g. 1 Kings 17:17-24; 2 Kings 4:19-37, 13:21; Mark 5:21-43 [paralleled in: Matthew 9:18-26, Luke 8:40-56]; Luke 7:11-17; Acts 9:36-43 & 14:19-20; John 11:5-44.

⁶³ Matthew 17:9-13.

⁶⁴ That the dead went to heaven in Jewish understanding in the time of Christ: cf. b.Talmud, *Chagigah* 12b; Philo, *On the Migration of Abraham* 2-3, *Questions and Answers on Genesis* 3.10-11, 4.74; Josephus, *Jewish War* 2.154-55, 3.372-75.

⁶⁵ Mark 6:14-16 (cf. Matthew 14:1-2 and Luke 9:7-8). That many Jews believed Elijah would return before the general resurrection is attested in Justin Martyr, *Dialogue of Justin and Trypho the Jew* 49, and was most directly based on Malachi 4:5, but also “interpreted” out of certain obscure passages in Zechariah.

⁶⁶ See: Hermann Strack & Paul Billerbeck, “Allgemeine oder teilweise Auferstehung der Toten?” [“Resurrection from the Dead: All at Once or in Stages?”] *Kommentar zum Neuen Testament aus Talmud und Midrash* 4.2 (1961): pp. 1166-98; Adolf Jellinek, ed., *Bet ha-Midrash* (1967), 3.13; Chaim Meir Horowitz, ed., *Bet Eked ha-Agadot* (1967), 1.58; Solomon Wertheimer, ed., *Leket Midrashim* (1960), pp. 6, 12.

⁶⁷ Matthew 27:52-53.

⁶⁸ 1 Corinthians 15:45.

⁶⁹ 1 Corinthians 15:22-24.

⁷⁰ See Romans 13:11-12; 1 Corinthians 7:29-31; and 1 Thessalonians 4:17. It seems every Christian generation for the next two centuries (or even the next two thousand years) expected it to come in their own lifetime. See, for example, Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 266-67.

⁷¹ In Romans 2:28-29 & Philippians 3:3.

⁷² Justin Martyr, *Apology* 1.21.

⁷³ Our resurrection just like Christ’s: 1 Corinthians 15:13 (and 15:15-16, 20, 23, 35); Philemon 3:21; Romans 6:5. Cf. 1 John 3:2. Our resurrection will be an ascension: 1 Thessalonians 4:13-18.

That Paul never distinguishes the resurrection and ascension of Christ is evident from all his kerygmatic hymns and lists: his summary of the Gospel in 1 Corinthians 15:1-8 mentions no ascension, only the resurrection (so also Romans 1:1-6). Even the summary of his Gospel in the forgery of 1 Timothy 3:16 mentions no resurrection, only the ascension. Yet Paul could not exclude mention of the resurrection in any summary of the Gospel, so he must have believed the ascension was the same thing (similarly for the “exaltation” of Christ: Philippians 2:5-11). At the very least, there is no evidence Paul regarded them as separate events.

¹ Tacitus, *Histories* 5.5.

² Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 16.160-175. For more on how the Jews and their scriptures were perceived, even by their enemies, see Menahem Stern, *Greek & Latin Authors on Jews & Judaism: With Introductions, Translations & Commentary* (1981).

³ Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1986): p. 331.

⁴ On the unstoppable introduction and success of novel cults throughout Roman society as far as Britain, see Robert Turcan, *The Cults of the Roman Empire*, 2nd ed. (1992) and Mary Beard, et al., *Religions of Rome: Volume 1, A History* (1998). **Manichaeism** was such a successful innovation it had to be violently suppressed by both pagan and Christian governments alike: cf. S. N. C. Lieu, *Manichaeism in the Later Roman Empire and Medieval China*, 2nd ed. (1992). **Antinoös** was Emperor Hadrian's lover who drowned in the Nile, and out of grief Hadrian founded a religion around the worship of his deified boy-toy. Though probably the least successful of the religions here named, it is notable for the fact that it was completely novel, yet officially sanctioned by the Imperial government, and embraced by many Romans and others. See Origen, *Against Celsus* 3.36 and Royston Lambert, *Beloved and God: The Story of Hadrian and Antinous* (1984). The worship of **Glaucon of Abonuteichos** was invented wholesale by his priest Alexander in the 2nd century A.D., yet commanded a significant and respectable following for centuries. See: Lucian, *Alexander the Quack Prophet* and the relevant material in C.P. Jones, *Culture and Society in Lucian* (1986) and Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1986).

⁵ Acts 17:21.

⁶ Tacitus, *Annals* 15.44.

⁷ Tacitus, *Histories* 5.4-5.

⁸ This Stoic eschatology is described or analyzed in Virgil, *Aeneid* 6.720-60; Alexander of Aphrodisias, *Commentary on Aristotle's 'Prior Analytics'* 180.33-6 & 181.25-31; Tatian, *Address to the Greeks* 6; Origen, *Contra Celsum* 5.20-21; John Philopon, *Commentary on Aristotle's 'On Generation and Decay'* 314.9-12. Even before the time of Christ the idea is attacked by the Epicurean Lucretius in *De Rerum Natura* 3.843-64. For sources on Zoroastrian eschatology, see notes in Chapter 3.

¹ This is thoroughly demonstrated by Martha Nussbaum, *The Therapy of Desire: Theory and Practice in Hellenistic Ethics* (1994) and Joseph Bryant, *Moral Codes and Social Structure in Ancient Greece: A Sociology of Greek Ethics from Homer to the Epicureans and Stoics* (1996).

² Nussbaum, op. cit.: p. 3.

³ See Robin Lane Fox, "Living Like Angels," *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 336-74.

⁴ Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1987): p. 335. He catalogues this discontent and Christianity's appeal to it in pp. 321-24

& 334 (and in pp. 325-31 he catalogues attractions of Christianity that support my general case throughout the present book). A more thorough case for exactly my point is made by Bruce Malina in *The Social Gospel of Jesus: The Kingdom of God in Mediterranean Perspective* (2000), although in some respects oversimplifying the facts. The general idea that the rich are necessarily immoral greedy liars who are not to be trusted is explained by Bruce Malina & Richard Rohrbaugh in "Rich, Poor, and Limited Good," *Social-Science Commentary on the Synoptic Gospels*, 2nd ed. (2003): pp. 400-401. See also the discussion of 'limited good' in Chapter 2.

⁵ See Cora Lutz, *Musonius Rufus: The Roman Socrates* (1942). On Musonius as second only to Socrates: Origen, *Contra Celsum* 3.66; Philostratus, *Life of Apollonius of Tyana* 4.46; "Letter to the High-Priest Theodorus" (16) and "Letter to Themistius" (20-22), written by the emperor Julian; Pliny, *Letters* 3.11; Dio of Prusa, *Orations* 31.122. See also Cassius Dio *Roman History* 66.13.

⁶ In fact, Holding's reference to temple prostitutes as a component of pagan religion has recently been refuted: there was never any such thing. See Stephanie Lynn Budin, *The Myth of Sacred Prostitution in Antiquity* (2008).

⁷ For example, see 1 Corinthians 5 and Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1987): p. 374. It's worth noting that the Christians did not expect perfection (Paul himself admitted to being a sinner in Romans 7:14-8:1), but allowed ample room for forgiveness and repentance before anyone was expelled for immorality (2 Corinthians 2:5-11; Galatians 6:1; James 5:15; 1 John 1:9, 2:12; Romans 4:6-8; John 20:22-23; Luke 17:3-4; Matthew 18:21-22, 18:35, 12:31, 6:12-15; Mark 3:28, 11:25).

⁸ On the Greek longing for socialist utopias, see Peter Green, "The Individual and Society: Slavery, Revolution, Utopias," *Alexander to Actium: The Historical Evolution of the Hellenistic Age* (1990): pp. 382-95. On Essene communism and respect for it even among some elites, see: "Essenes" in the *Encyclopedia Judaica* (1971): 6:899-902; *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, 3rd ed. (1997): 562; *Encyclopedia of the Dead Sea Scrolls* (2000): 1.262-69; and for ancient witnesses: Philo, *Hypothetica* 11.1-18 and *Every Good Man Is Free* 75-88; Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 5.73 (or 5.15 or 5.17 in some modern editions); Synesius, *Dio* 3.2;

Josephus, *Jewish War* 2.119-61 and *Jewish Antiquities* 15.371-79 (the sect was honored by none other than Herod himself) and 18.18-22; Hippolytus, *Refutation of All Heresies* 9.18.3-9.28.2.

⁹ See Naphtali Lewis & Meyer Reinhold, *Roman Civilization: Selected Readings*, 3rd ed., vol. 2 (1990): § 66 & 77.

¹⁰ For discussion of this psychology in the context of modern American spirituality, see, e.g., David Myers, "Faith, Hope, and Joy" in *The Pursuit of Happiness* (1992): pp. 177-204.

¹¹ Rodney Stark, *The Rise of Christianity* (1996): pp. 188-89. This summarizes what he demonstrates throughout the rest of his book. See also Jack Sanders, *Charisma, Converts, Competitors: Societal and Sociological Factors in the Success of Early Christianity* (2000). As an added example, Christian forgiveness of moral failure (see note 7 above) was itself a very attractive feature of the movement, especially when set against the harsh and unforgiving response one might receive elsewhere.

¹ That this was the staple idea of pagan religious life is thoroughly documented in: Ramsay MacMullen, *Paganism in the Roman Empire* (1981); Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 27-264; and Mary Beard, et al., *Religions of Rome: Volume 1, A History & Religions of Rome: Volume 2, A Sourcebook* (1998).

² On the Epicurean use of this fact to argue against divine responsiveness, see: Lucretius, *De Rerum Natura* 2.1090-1104; 5.195-234, 1194-1240; 6.387-95; etc. On the responses of sorcerers to the failed expectations of pagans, see Plutarch, *On Superstition* and Robert Turcan, "Occultism and Theosophy," *The Cults of the Roman Empire*, 2nd ed. (1992): pp. 266-90. On the responses of holy men, see E. R. Dodds, *The Greeks and the Irrational* (1951) and Graham Anderson, *Sage, Saint, and Sophist: Holy Men and Their Associates in the Early Roman Empire* (1994): pp. 106-08.

³ For a full discussion of how humans are naturally constructed to develop superstitious thinking like this as a consequence of inevitable statistical laws (including regression to the mean), see Stuart Vyse, *Believing in Magic: The Psychology of Superstition* (1997).

⁴ For instance, see the arguments to this effect advanced by the Christians: Athenagoras, *Plea for the Christians*, esp. 26-27 (vs. 32-34); Tatian, *Address to the Greeks*, esp. 8-10, 16-20; and Justin, *Apology* 1.5, 1.9-10, 1.14, 1.54-56, 1.62, 2.1, 2.5-7, 2.12. Also see

Richard Horsley, *Paul & Empire: Religion & Power in Roman Imperial Society* (1997): esp. pp. 142-43, 176-181.

⁵ For a discussion of these and other natural reasons why the Christian mission had a rhetorical and systemic edge over paganism in the area of health care, see Hector Avalos, *Health Care and the Rise of Christianity* (1999). On psychosomatic healing phenomena in general see Edward Shorter, *From Paralysis to Fatigue: A History of Psychosomatic Illness in the Modern Era* (1992). A good discussion is also available in Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 327-29.

⁶ 2 Corinthians 4:3-4.

⁷ Galatians 4:8.

⁸ Galatians 5:17-24; Ephesians 5:5; Colossians 3; 2 Peter 1:4; Romans 1:20-29.

⁹ 1 Corinthians 2:12; Ephesians 2:2, 6:12; cf. 1 John 4:1-3.

¹⁰ Acts 5:3; 26:18; 1 John 5:18-19; 1 Corinthians 15:24-28; Romans 1:19-32, 8:20-22; cf. Mark 8:33; Luke 22:3; Matthew 16:23.

¹¹ 1 Corinthians 9:20-23, 10:27-32; Galatians 2:11-14.

¹² 1 Corinthians 7:12-16 and 5:9-13.

¹³ Matthew 10:32-39, 12:47-50, 19:29; see also Mark 10:29-30 and Luke 12:53 (v. 14:26).

¹⁴ Cassius Dio, *Roman History* 67.14. An earlier account in Suetonius, *Domitian* 10, doesn't identify the charge.

Chapter 7 (*Vulnerable to Disproof?*)

¹ This and previous quotes from Tacitus, *Annals* 3.44, 3.19, 4.11.

² For the fact that this is the standard consensus view, and a justified view, see: Michael Grant, *Greek and Roman Historians: Information and Misinformation* (1995); Charles Fornara, *The Nature of History in Ancient Greece and Rome* (1983); John Marincola, *Authority and Tradition in Ancient Historiography* (1997); Averil Cameron, ed. *History As Text: The Writing of Ancient History* (1990); Bruno Gentili & Giovanni Cerri, *History and Biography in Ancient Thought* (1988).

³ See scholarship in the previous note, as well as Michael Grant, *The Ancient Historians* (1970). A good survey of scholarship on ancient historiography is also presented by Colin Hemer, "Ancient Historiography," *The Book of Acts in the Setting of Hellenistic History* (1990): pp. 63-100. Hemer's botched use of this evidence for Luke-Acts is addressed later on in this chapter.

⁴ See "Acta" in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (1996): p. 10 (and the sources there cited).

⁵ The scholarship in note 2 above discusses this issue in detail, but the *locus classicus* for understanding speechmaking in ancient histories is still F.W. Wallbank, "Speeches in Greek Historians," *J.L. Myres Memorial Lecture* No. 3 (1965), discussed next.

⁶ Wallbank, *op. cit.*: p. 18.

⁷ In book 5 of Thucydides' *Peloponnesian War*.

⁸ Thucydides, *Peloponnesian War* 1.22.1 (translation from Wallbank, but emphasis added).

⁹ F.F. Bruce, "The Speeches in Acts," *The Acts of the Apostles: The Greek Text with Introduction and Commentary*, 3rd ed. (1990): pp. 34-40.

¹⁰ In Bruce, op. cit.: p. 35 (n. 4).

¹¹ Karla McLaren, "Bridging the Chasm between Two Cultures," *Skeptical Inquirer* 28.3 (May/June 2004): pp. 47-52.

¹² I calculated this statistic from these facts: We know the names of at most three thousand authors—whether their writings survive or not—over the course of a thousand years (from roughly 500 B.C. to 500 A.D.). Yet in that time, the population remained steady between 60 and 120 million (throughout the territory encompassed by the Roman Empire at its height), and given the average life expectancy of less than 50 years, there would have been a complete turn-over of the population approximately every half a century, for a total of about 1 or 2 billion people. Therefore: 1000 years ÷ 50 years = 20 average lifespans; 60 to 120 million lives x 20 lifespans = 1.2 to 2.4 billion lives lived; 1.2 to 2.4 billion total lives lived ÷ 3,000 writers' lives = 400,000 to 800,000 people per known writer.

For the above population and lifespan estimates, see T.G. Parkin, *Demography and Roman Society* (1992), esp. "Frier's Life Table for the Roman Empire" on p. 144 (which I reproduce in part at www.richardcarrier.info/lifetbl.html), and Bruce Frier, *Landlords and Tenants in Imperial Rome* (1980); Ansley Coale, *Regional Model Life Tables and Stable Populations*, 2nd ed. (1983); and Roger Bagnall & Bruce Frier, *The Demography of Roman Egypt* (1994). As to the number of authors in that period, the *Thesaurus Linguae Graecae* contains every extant Greek author within that date range, numbering 1,384. This number includes authors known only in quotations or fragments, and most of those known only by name. It is well-known that the number of Latin authors in that period is much smaller than for Greek, so more than doubling the *TLG* number to 3,000 is without doubt a huge over-estimate.

¹³ I discuss this case in detail in my Columbia University Master's Thesis: Richard Carrier, "Cultural History of the Lunar and Solar Eclipse in the Early Roman Empire" (1998), available as an Acrobat document at www.richardcarrier.info/culturaleclipse.pdf.

However, in brief: the inscription set up by Claudius is discussed in Cassius Dio, *Roman History* 60.26.1, and the main passages from ancient texts that relate to all the other claims made here include: Seneca, *Natural Questions* 7.1.2 and 7.25.3, *Phaedra* 788-94, *Hercules Oetaeus* 523-27, *On Benefits* 5.6.4; Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 2.54 and 25.10 (w. 2.53, 2.43); Statius, *Thebaid* 6.685-88; Ovid, *Metamorphoses* 7.207-09 and 12.262-64,

14.365-68, *Amores* 1.8.12-14, *Heroides* 6.85-86; Lucan, *Pharsalia* 6.499-506; Plutarch, *Advice to Bride and Groom* 145c-d, *Nicias* 23.1-3, *Aemilius Paulus* 17.7-11; Lucian, *Lover of Lies* 14; Hippolytus, *Refutation of All Heresies* 37; Marcus Manilius, *Astronomica* 1.226; Apuleius, *Metamorphosis* 1.3.1, 1.8.4; Apollonius, *Argonautica* 4.57-67; Aristophanes, *Clouds* 749-52; Plato, *Gorgias* 513a (cf. also: *Papyri Magicae Graecae* §34); Cicero, *On the Republic* 1.23; Livy, *From the Founding of the City* 44.38.5-9; Quintus Curtius Rufus, *History of Alexander* 4.10.1-7; Valerius Maximus, *Memorable Deeds and Sayings* 8.11, 11.1; Tacitus, *Annals* 1.28; Frontinus, *Stratagems* 1.12.8.

¹⁴ F.F. Bruce, "Luke as a Historian," *The Acts of the Apostles: The Greek Text with Introduction and Commentary*, 3rd ed. (1990): p. 27 (see also pp. 27-34 and 35-46).

¹⁵ On the genre of the other Gospels, the most decisive work is still Charles Talbert, *What Is a Gospel? The Genre of the Canonical Gospels* (1977).

¹⁶ As in Mark 1:14-15, hence 1 Corinthians 15:3-4.

¹⁷ Colin Hemer, *The Book of Acts in the Setting of Hellenistic History* (1990); cf. also Colin Hemer, "Luke the Historian," *Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester* 60 (1977-1978): pp. 28-51.

¹⁸ See the foreword (pp. vii-viii) of Hemer, op. cit. (1990).

¹⁹ See Richard Pervo, *Dating Acts: Between the Evangelists and the Apologists* (2006) and David Trobisch, *The First Edition of the New Testament* (2000).

²⁰ John Lentz, book review, *The Journal of Theological Studies* 41.1 (April 1991): pp. 227-30.

²¹ For example, see Richard Carrier, "The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb," in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, eds. Jeff Lowder & Bob Price (2005): pp. 168-70.

²² Christopher Matthews, book review, *Journal of Biblical Literature* 109 (1990): pp. 726-29.

²³ C.K. Barrett, review of *The Trial of St. Paul*, in *The Journal of Theological Studies* 41.1 (April 1991): pp. 230-31.

²⁴ Hemer, op. cit. (1990): p. 326.

²⁵ For *plêrophoreô* as “fully assured” rather than “completed,” see *plêrophoreô* in Henry Liddell and Robert Scott’s *A Greek-English Lexicon*. And compare Romans 4:21, 14:5; Colossians 2:2, 4:12; and the nominal cognate in 1 Thessalonians 1:5 and Hebrews 6:11, 10:22. The same verb in 2 Timothy 4:5 & 4:17 does not mean “completed” but “satisfied.” There is not even a single case in the Bible where this verb means “completed” as in “happened,” and I am not aware of any cases outside the Bible, either (though if anyone thinks they’ve found one, please let me know). And for *kathôs* as “according to what” (i.e. “according as” or “according to how”) instead of the usual (and ambiguous) translation “even as,” see the entry in Liddell & Scott’s lexicon (above) on *kathôs* and its synonym *katha*, which is the word’s primary meaning.

²⁶ See *epigignôskô* in Liddell & Scott’s *A Greek-English Lexicon*.

²⁷ See Hemer, op. cit. (1990): pp. 98-99, 322-28.

²⁸ Josephus, *Against Apion* 1.53.

²⁹ See *akribês* in Liddell & Scott’s *A Greek-English Lexicon*.

³⁰ See *parakoouthêô* in Liddell & Scott’s *A Greek-English Lexicon*.

³¹ In Suetonius, *Gaius* 8.

³² From the Rolfe & Arkenberg translation available on Fordham University’s website (www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/suetonius-caligula.html).

³³ See: C.K. Barrett, *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Acts of the Apostles* (1998); F.F. Bruce, “The Text of Acts,” *The Acts of the Apostles: The Greek Text with Introduction and Commentary*, 3rd ed. (1990): pp. 69ff.; Hans Conzelmann, *Acts of the Apostles: A Commentary on the Acts of the Apostles*, 2nd ed. (1972): pp. xxxiv-xxxv, xxxix-xl, 127, 215; Ernst Haenchen, “The Text of Acts,” *The Acts of the Apostles: A Commentary* (1971): pp. 50ff. (on Luke not likely being a companion of Paul: pp. 88-89, 112-16, 726-32); and (on the literary creation of the “we” pas-

sages) Dennis MacDonald, "The Shipwrecks of Odysseus and Paul," *New Testament Studies* 45 (1999): pp. 88-107.

³⁴ Barrett, op. cit.: p. xlv.

³⁵ Barrett, op. cit.: p. xlv.

³⁶ Haenchen, op. cit.: p. 85; with MacDonald, op. cit. (1999).

³⁷ John Polhill, *Acts: The New American Commentary* (1992): p. 39.

³⁸ See references in note 33 above, plus the excellent & extensive discussion of W.A. Strange, *The Problem of the Text of Acts* (1992).

³⁹ In the actual original text Holding wrote "No, and he could not have if it was not true," which must be a typo. Holding surely meant to omit the 'not' as his ensuing argument makes clear. Accordingly, I have omitted it.

⁴⁰ Literally, Paul says *ei pathêtos ho Christos ei prôtos ex anastaseôs nekrôn phôs mellei kataggellein* (Acts 26:23) in indirect discourse, as what Moses and the prophets "said" was "going to happen" (*elalêsan mellontôn ginesthai*, 26:22), i.e. "whether the Messiah was subject to suffering, whether first from a resurrection from the dead he was going to proclaim a light," etc.

⁴¹ Quoting from the entry for *ei* in Liddell & Scott's *A Greek-English Lexicon*.

⁴² See *mellô* in Liddell & Scott's *A Greek-English Lexicon*.

⁴³ Other than perhaps an event that no one witnessed, which is a distinct possibility I will explore in my forthcoming book *On the Historicity of Jesus Christ*.

⁴⁴ On this "decurion" class, see the entry for *decuriones* in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (1996): pp. 437-38. It was the most general rank below the equestrian and senatorial classes.

⁴⁵ See Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 305-07.

⁴⁶ Joseph was “secretly” a Disciple in John 19:38, and perhaps openly in Matthew 27:57, but merely a “seeker” (not a Disciple) in Mark 15:43 & Luke 23:50-51. On Nicodemus: John 3:1-10, 7:50-52, 19:39-41.

⁴⁷ For more on Joseph’s possible role in the burial of Jesus, see Richard Carrier, “The Burial of Jesus in Light of Jewish Law,” *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, ed. by Robert M. Price and Jeffery Jay Lowder (2005): pp. 369-92.

⁴⁸ Pliny the Younger to his friend Licinius Sura, *Letters* 7.27.1-3 & 12-14; Tacitus, *Annals* 11.21. Documenting this credulity as widespread in ancient society is Lucian’s treatise *The Lover of Lies*.

⁴⁹ Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 19.346-50.

⁵⁰ Thomas Africa, “Worms and the Death of Kings: A Cautionary Note on Disease and History,” *Classical Antiquity* 1 (1982): pp. 1-17.

⁵¹ See “Julius Agrippa II, Marcus” in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (1996): p. 779.

⁵² F.F. Bruce, *The Acts of the Apostles: The Greek Text with Introduction and Commentary*, 3rd ed. (1990): pp. 11-12.

⁵³ W.A. Strange, *The Problem of the Text of Acts* (1992): p. 182.

⁵⁴ Ben Witherington III, *The Acts of the Apostles: A Socio-Rhetorical Commentary* (1998): p. 63.

⁵⁵ Matthew 27:51-54 and 28:2.

⁵⁶ See my discussion of this in Richard Carrier, “Thallus: An Analysis” (The Secular Web: 1999) at www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/thallus.html.

⁵⁷ Matthew 27:52-53.

⁵⁸ See note 12 above on sources for demographics and life tables for ancient populations.

⁵⁹ Josephus, *Life* 360, *Jewish War* 1.15, *Against Apion* 1.55.

⁶⁰ For an account of this curious event (with further references) see the Wikipedia entry for “H. Rochester Sneath” at en.wikipedia.org/wiki/H._Rochester_Sneath.

⁶¹ Mentioned in Mark 15:38; Matthew 27:51; and Luke 23:45. John makes no mention of it.

⁶² Mishnah, *Yoma* 5.1, *Middot* 1.1h, and various sections in *Sheqalim*. According to the detailed description in Josephus, *Jewish War* 5.184-227, this veil would not have been visible to anyone else.

¹ Quote from David DeSilva, *Honor, Patronage, Kinship & Purity: Unlocking New Testament Culture* (2000): p. 44. For a summary and bibliography of the scholarship on early Christian persecution and martyrdom, see Caroline Bynum, *Resurrection of the Body in Western Christianity: 200-1336* (1995): p. 44. For a more thorough discussion of the issue, see: W.H.C. Frend, “Martyrdom and Political Oppression,” *The Early Christian World*, vol. 2, ed. Philip Esler (2000): pp. 815-39; Mary Beard, et al., *Religions of Rome: Volume 1, A History* (1998): pp. 236-44; and Robin Lane Fox, “Persecution and Martyrdom,” *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 419-92.

² On the voiding of the legal acts of Nero and Domitian, see “*damnatio memoriae*” in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (1996): p. 427.

³ For the Pliny-Trajan exchange, see Pliny the Younger, *Epistles* 10.96-97. On the law against illegal assembly in Pliny’s province at the time (which Christians were certainly violating), *ibid.* 10.34. See also my related discussion in Chapter 18.

⁴ *Diôkô*: 1 Maccabees 3:24, 4:9, 4:16, 7:45, 9:15, 11:73, 12:51, 15:39; 2 Maccabees 2:21, 2:31, 5:8 (all are military actions). *Zêlos*: 1 Maccabees 2:27, 2:54, 2:58, 8:16.

⁵ See *diôkô* in Henry George Liddell & Robert Scott’s *A Greek-English Lexicon*.

⁶ See *zêlos* in Liddell & Scott’s *A Greek-English Lexicon*.

⁷ W.H.C. Frend, “Martyrdom and Political Oppression,” *The Early Christian World*, vol. 2, ed. Philip Esler (2000): p. 818.

⁸ Alan Segal, *Life After Death: A History of the Afterlife in Western Religion* (2004): p. 314. His entire chapter on millennial and apocalyptic movements covers the evidence and scholarship, and links it to both Judaism and Christianity, as well as Islam and several indigenous religious movements. See also Arthur Droge & James Tabor, *A Noble Death: Suicide and Martyrdom among Christians and Jews in Antiquity* (1992).

⁹ All of this is apparent to any attentive student of human history. But Eric Hoffer's *The True Believer: Thoughts on the Nature of Mass Movements* (1951) is still a best-selling discussion of it.

¹⁰ See Philippians 2:25; Philemon 1:2; 1 Timothy 1:18; 2 Timothy 2:3-4.

¹¹ Philippians 1:19-24.

¹² For example: 1 Corinthians 12 & 15:1-8; 2 Corinthians 12:12; Galatians 1:11-12, 15-19 & 3:5; Romans 16:25-26; Acts 9:3-9. I examine this point from several angles in Chapters 13 and 17.

¹³ 2 Corinthians 12:6-10.

¹⁴ On this cultural context, see: Robin Lane Fox, "Seeing the Gods," *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 102-67; Alan Segal, "Religiously-Interpreted States of Consciousness: Prophecy, Self-Consciousness, and Life After Death," *Life after Death: A History of the Afterlife in Western Religion* (2004): pp. 322-50; Peter Green, *Alexander to Actium: The Historical Evolution of the Hellenistic Age* (1990): pp. 408-13, 594-95; E.R. Dodds, "The Blessings of Madness" and "Dream-Pattern and Culture-Pattern," *The Greeks and the Irrational* (1951): pp. 64-101 and 102-34.

On the scientific background, see: John Horgan, *Rational Mysticism: Dispatches from the Border between Science and Spirituality* (2003); Eugene D'Aquili and Andrew Newberg, *Why God Won't Go Away: Brain Science and the Biology of Belief* (2001) and *The Mystical Mind: Probing the Biology of Religious Experience* (1999); and further discussion and bibliography in Richard Carrier, *Sense and Goodness without God: A Defense of Metaphysical Naturalism* (2005): pp. 202-08.

On both aspects, in the context of ancient religion and early Christianity in particular, see: Richard Carrier, "The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb," in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, ed. by Robert M. Price and Jeffery Jay Lowder (2005): pp. 182-95, 151-54. See also Caroline Bynum, *Resurrection of the Body in Western Christianity, 200-1336* (1995): pp. 63-71.

¹⁵ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 2.60. Incidentally, Origen says these apparitions are therefore astral bodies, not flesh, as he did not believe Jesus rose in the flesh, but had switched bodies, leaving the corpse

behind and donning a new astral body (cf. *Contra Celsum* 5.18-24, 6.29, 7.32, etc., along with related material in my “Spiritual Body FAQ” online at www.richardcarrier.info/SpiritualFAQ.html).

¹⁶ 1 Corinthians 7:12-16, 10:20-32.

¹⁷ See e.g. 1 Corinthians 8:7-13.

¹⁸ See e.g. 1 Corinthians 9:20-23.

¹⁹ See e.g. 1 Thessalonians 3:12 & 5:15 and Titus 3:2.

²⁰ See e.g. 1 Corinthians 9:11-18 and Acts 20:33-34.

²¹ See e.g. 1 Timothy 3:3, 6:10; 2 Timothy 3:2.

²² See: Romans 12:17-18 & 13:1-7; 1 Peter 2:12-17 & 4:15; 2 Corinthians 8:21; Galatians 6:10; Colossians 3:22; Hebrews 12:14.

²³ Revelation 2:8-10 and 2:12-13.

²⁴ See e.g. Hebrews 12; Philemon 1:29; 1 Thessalonians 1:6; 1 Peter 3:18, 4:1, 4:13.

²⁵ Aristotle, *Rhetoric* 1.2.1355b-58a and 1.15.1375a.

²⁶ See the translation of W. Rhys Roberts, reproduced by Associate Professor Lee Honeycutt of Iowa State University, at www.public.iastate.edu/~honeyl/Rhetoric/rhet1-2.html.

Chapter 9 (*Was a God Incarnate Repugnant?*)

¹ See: Earl Doherty, *The Jesus Puzzle: Did Christianity Begin with a Mythical Christ? Challenging the Existence of an Historical Jesus*, rev. ed. (2000), new rev. ed. forthcoming. My own book *On the Historicity of Jesus Christ* (forthcoming) will examine the essentials of his theory even more thoroughly. See also Doherty's website www.jesuspuzzle.com and my critical review of Doherty's book: Richard Carrier, "Did Jesus Exist? Earl Doherty and the Argument to Ahistoricity" (The Secular Web: 2002) at www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/jesuspuzzle.shtml.

² See, for example: 2 Samuel 7:14; Psalms 2:7 & 89:26-27; 1 Chronicles 17:13, 22:10-11, 28:6. Likewise, Israel (Jacob) was not only called "Son of God" but "God's firstborn son" (Hosea 11:1, Exodus 4:22-23). See "Son of God" in the *Dictionary of Judaism in the Biblical Period*, ed. Jacob Neusner (1996).

³ See, for example: John 1:12-13; Galatians 3:26-27 & 4:5-6; Romans 8:14-17; 1 John 5:1. And see "Son of God" in Bruce Malina & Richard Rohrbaugh, *Social-Science Commentary on the Synoptic Gospels*, 2nd ed. (2003): pp. 408-09.

⁴ See: David Horrell, "Early Jewish Christianity," *The Early Christian World*, vol. 2, ed. Philip Esler (2000): pp. 136-67. For the shift in the first century toward a predominately Gentile Christianity see: Todd Klutz, "Paul and the Development of Gentile Christianity," *ibid.*: pp. 168-97. On later doctoring of the New Testament to conceal this fact: Bart Ehrman, *The Orthodox Corruption of Scripture: The Effect of Early Christological Controversies on the Text of the New Testament* (1993): esp. "Anti-Adoptionistic Corruptions of Scripture," pp. 47-118.

⁵ See, for example: Numbers 11:25, 11:29, 24:2; Judges 3:9-10, 6:34, 11:29, 14:6, 14:19, 15:14; 1 Samuel 10:6, 10:10, 11:6, 16:13, 19:20, 19:23; 2 Chronicles 15:1, 20:14, 24:20; Isaiah 11:2, 59:21, 61:1; Ezekiel 11:5, 37:12-14 (which anticipates the Christian idea that at the Resurrection God's spirit will inhabit all the saved, exactly as Paul says has happened); Micah 3:8; Zechariah 7:12. See also: Exodus 31:1-5; Numbers 23:7 (the Septuagint text); Daniel 4:8-9, 4:18, 5:11, 5:14 (all singular in the Septuagint text).

⁶ And this idea may even be a later development, since the authenticity of Colossians is in doubt: see "Colossians, Letter to the" in *Eerdmans Dictionary of the Bible* (2000).

⁷ Philo, *On the Confusion of Tongues* 62-63.

⁸ Philo, *On the Confusion of Tongues* 146. Compare John 1:1, Gal. 3:27, Rom. 15:7, 1 Cor. 11:1, etc.

⁹ Philo, *On Dreams* 1.215.

¹⁰ John Barclay, *Jews in the Mediterranean Diaspora: From Alexander to Trajan (323 BCE - 117 CE)* (1993): quote from p. 83. See also: Morton Smith, "Palestinian Judaism in the First Century," *Israel: Its Role in Civilization*, ed. Moshe Davis (1956): pp. 67-81; and Richard Carrier, "The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb," in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, ed. by Robert M. Price and Jeffery Jay Lowder (2005): pp. 107-18.

¹¹ Acts 14:11-13.

¹² Acts 28:3-6.

¹³ Plutarch, *Romulus* 27-28; Acts 14:11-12; Celsus, as quoted in Origen, *Contra Celsum* 7.9. And see related notes in Chapter 1.

¹⁴ N.T. Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God* (2003): pp. 720, 721 (cf. pp. 719-38).

Chapter 10 (Never Switch Groups?)

¹ Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 5.73. See note 11 below for sources on the Essene sect.

² Philo, *On the Contemplative Life* 18-21.

³ Bruce Malina & Jerome Neyrey, *Portraits of Paul: An Archaeology of Ancient Personality* (1996). Numbers in parentheses after POP in the body of this chapter refer to pages in this book. Malina's theories of the origin and development of Christianity can be

further pursued in: Bruce Malina, *The Social Gospel of Jesus: The Kingdom of God in Mediterranean Perspective* (2000), on which see notes below, as well as *The New Jerusalem in the Revelation of John: The City As Symbol of Life with God* (2000) and *Christian Origins and Cultural Anthropology: Practical Models for Biblical Interpretation* (1986); and Bruce Malina & Richard Rohrbaugh, *Social-Science Commentary on the Synoptic Gospels*, 2nd ed. (2003) and *Social-Science Commentary on the Gospel on John* (1998). See also Bruce Malina & John Pilch, *Social Science Commentary on the Book of Revelation* (2000).

⁴ As Bruce Malina explains in *The Social Gospel of Jesus* (2000): pp. 141-61.

⁵ Bruce Malina to Richard Carrier, e-mail of 15 April 2005.

⁶ For example, see Plutarch, *On Isis and Osiris* 58.374e and 78.382e-f. I'll discuss this phenomenon in greater detail in my forthcoming book *On the Historicity of Jesus Christ*.

⁷ On Origin's discussion of such multi-level 'truths' within the Church see my related discussion in my "Spiritual Body FAQ" at www.richardcarrier.info/SpiritualFAQ.html#origin.

⁸ See Magnus Zetterholm, *The Formation of Christianity in Antioch: A Social-Scientific Approach to the Separation between Judaism and Christianity* (2003): pp. 28-31.

⁹ Josephus, *Life* 2 (pars. 7-12).

¹⁰ Nasaraeans and Ossaeans: Epiphanius, *Panarion* 18-19 (the Nasaraeans should not be confused with the Nazoreans, which appears to have been the original name for the Christians (and thus the collective name for Torah-observant Christians): Epiphanius, *Panarion* 29; Jerome, *Epistles* 112.13; Acts 24:5).

¹¹ On Jewish sects of the time: Richard Carrier, "The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb," in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave*, eds. Jeff Lowder & Bob Price (2005): pp. 107-10, 198-201 (with related material in my "Spiritual Body FAQ" at www.richardcarrier.info/SpiritualFAQ.html).

¹² Bruce Malina, *The Social Gospel of Jesus* (2001): pp. 141-61.

¹³ As Lucian explains in his autobiographical oration *The Dream* (aka *Lucian's Career*). I provide a more detailed analysis of this point in my forthcoming book *The Scientist in the Early Roman Empire*.

¹⁴ As explained in Chapter 1, and by Holding's own favorite scholar: David DeSilva, *Honor, Patronage, Kinship & Purity: Unlocking New Testament Culture* (2000): pp. 51-55.

¹⁵ This and following quotation from the conclusion of Bruce Malina, *The New Testament World: Insights from Cultural Anthropology*, 3rd ed. (2001): pp. 217, 216. So, also, his conclusion to *The Social Gospel of Jesus* (2000): pp. 141-61.

¹⁶ See excellent summaries in Bruce Malina & John Pilch, *Social Science Commentary on the Book of Revelation* (2000): pp. 1-13, 19-24, 41-44. I cannot emphasize more: these three sections are required reading for anyone who intends to engage in biblical interpretation. See also *Portraits of Paul* (1996): pp. 212-18 and his priceless introduction to *The Social Gospel of Jesus* (2000): pp. 1-13, which is also a must-read.

¹⁷ On this model of Christian motivation see Richard Carrier, "Whence Christianity? A Meta-Theory for the Origins of Christianity," *Journal of Higher Criticism* 11.1 (Spring 2005): 22-34.

¹⁸ See: Romans 13:1-7; Colossians 3:22; Titus 3:1-2; 1 Timothy 2:1-2 & 6:1-2; 1 Peter 2:12-17.

¹⁹ See: Romans 12, 1 Corinthians 12, Ephesians 3:6 & 5:30.

²⁰ John 1:12-13; Romans 8:14-15 & 8:23; Galatians 3:26-27 & 4:5-6; Ephesians 1:5; 1 John 5:1; etc.

²¹ David DeSilva, *Honor, Patronage, Kinship & Purity: Unlocking New Testament Culture* (2000): pp. 60 and 200.

²² DeSilva, op. cit.: p. 211.

²³ DeSilva, op. cit.: pp. 71, 199-239.

²⁴ Philo, *On the Contemplative Life* 90 and *Questions and Answers on Genesis* 4.74.

²⁵ See: Evan Fales, "Scientific Explanations of Mystical Experiences, Part I: the Case of St. Teresa," *Religious Studies* 32 (1996): pp. 143-163; "Scientific Explanations of Mystical Experiences, Part II: The Challenge to Theism," *Religious Studies* 32 (1996): pp. 297-313; and "Can Science Explain Mysticism?" *Religious Studies* 35 (1999): pp. 213-227. See also Bruce Malina, *The Social Gospel of Jesus* (2000): pp. 129-31; Alan Segal, "Religiously-Interpreted States of Consciousness: Prophecy, Self-Consciousness, and Life After Death," in *Life after Death: A History of the Afterlife in Western Religion* (2004): pp. 322-50; and I.M. Lewis, *Ecstatic Religion: A Study of Shamanism and Spirit Possession* (1989). Further relevant sources on this point will appear in my forthcoming book *On the Historicity of Jesus Christ*.

²⁶ Bruce Malina & John Pilch, *Social Science Commentary on the Book of Revelation* (2000): pp. 5, 43.

²⁷ Besides material in earlier note above, see: Bruce Malina & Richard Rohrbaugh, *Social-Science Commentary on the Synoptic Gospels*, 2nd ed. (2003): pp. 140, 369, 398-99; and *Social-Science Commentary on the Gospel on John* (1998): pp. 282-85.

²⁸ Bruce Malina to Richard Carrier, e-mail of 15 April 2005. He referred me to John Pilch, "Altered States of Consciousness in the Synoptics," in *The Social Setting of Jesus and the Gospels*, eds. Wolfgang Stegemann, Bruce Malina and Gerd Theissen (2002): pp. 103-116.

²⁹ On all of this see references in note 14 in Chapter 8 (and note 25 above).

³⁰ This was well-documented long ago in the still-masterful study by A.D. Nock, *Conversion: The Old and the New in Religion from Alexander the Great to Augustine of Hippo* (1933). On social mobility in general, the relevant facts can be gleaned from Ramsay MacMullen, *Roman Social Relations: 50 B.C. to A.D. 284*, and Jo-Ann Shelton, *As the Romans Did: A Sourcebook in Roman Social History*, 2nd ed. (1998).

³¹ See the concise yet thorough summary of anti-Christian polemic up to the end of the 2nd century in R. J. Hoffmann, *Celsus on the True Doctrine: A Discourse against the Christians* (1987): pp. 5-

49. See in particular such examples as in Athenagoras, *Plea for the Christians* 3.

³² Athenagoras, *Plea for the Christians* 11-12 & 31-32; Justin Martyr, *Apology* 1.4-7 & 1.16-17.

³³ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 8.69-70.

³⁴ This case is excellently made in Bruce Malina, *The Social Gospel of Jesus: The Kingdom of God in Mediterranean Perspective* (2000). I cannot recommend this book more. It is essential reading on the subject of Christianity's origin and success, even if Malina occasionally exaggerates, oversimplifies, or errs on various points, warranting some caution (I'll discuss an example in Chapter 11).

³⁵ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 6.2.

¹ Gillian Cloke, “Women, Worship, and Mission: The Church in the Household,” *The Early Christian World*, vol. 1, ed. Philip Esler (2000): pp. 422-51 (quotes from p. 423).

² Romans 16:1; 1 Timothy 3:1-13 (esp. 3:11); and Pliny the Younger, *Letters* 10.96.8. For more on women in the early expansion of the Christian church, see Chapter 18.

³ See Richard Carrier, ‘What about Women?’ in “Reply to McFall on Jesus as a Philosopher” (Frontline Apologetics, 2004: at www.frontline-apologetics.com/carrier_on_jesus_2.htm#s22) and the sources cited there (with further discussion in my forthcoming book *The Scientist in the Early Roman Empire*), as well as “Women in Cult” and “Women in Philosophy” in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (1996): pp. 1624-26. For a Jewish sect that admitted women, see Philo, *On the Contemplative Life* 90 and *Questions and Answers on Genesis* 4.74 (Philo in fact praises this, rather than frowning on it). For women as supporters of synagogues, see William Horbury, “Women in Office,” *The Cambridge History of Judaism*, vol. 3 (1999): pp. 388-401; and Bernadette Brooten, “Inscriptional Evidence for Women as Leaders in the Ancient Synagogue,” *Society of Biblical Literature Seminar Papers* 20 (1981): pp. 1-17. On Jewish women receiving positions of authority and prestige in mainstream sects, see Peter W. van der Horst, “Conflicting Images of Women in Ancient Judaism,” *Hel-lenism-Judaism-Christianity: Essays on Their Interaction*, 2nd ed. (1998): pp. 73-92.

⁴ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 2.59-60.

⁵ **Masada:** Josephus, *Jewish War* 7.399. **Gamala:** Josephus, *Jewish War* 4.81.

⁶ For an example of contemporary skepticism of Josephus’ Masada and Gamala tales see: Kenneth Atkinson, “Noble Deaths at Gamla and Masada? A Critical Assessment of Josephus’ Accounts of Jewish Resistance in Light of Archaeological Discoveries,” in *Making History: Josephus and Historical Method*, ed. Zuleika Rodgers (2007): pp. 349-71. One sign is that the two stories are very similar and yet coincidentally attested by exactly two women in each case.

⁷ Bruce Malina & Jerome Neyrey, *Portraits of Paul: An Archaeology of Ancient Personality* (1996): p. 82.

⁸ See Michael Gagarin & David Cohen, eds., *The Cambridge Companion to Ancient Greek Law* (2005): pp. 150-51.

⁹ The only three sources Malina & Neyrey cite are: Robert Bonner & Hansen Harrell, *Evidence in Athenian Courts and Public Arbitration in Athenian Law* (1905): pp. 27-28, 32; Robert Bonner, *Lawyers and Litigants in Ancient Athens: The Genesis of the Legal Profession* (1927 - which makes this their most recent source, at 75 years obsolete): pp. 185-88; and A. Greenidge, *The Legal Procedure of Cicero's Time* (1901): pp. 482-83.

¹⁰ Cicero, *Against Verres* 2.1.94 (the testimony of women is approved again at 4.99).

¹¹ Jane Rowlandson, ed., *Women & Society in Greek & Roman Egypt: A Sourcebook* (1998): § 91 (pp. 117-18) = *P.Oxy.* 1.37 (Egypt, 49 A.D.); § 257 (pp. 324-25) = *BGU* 4.1105 (Alexandria, 10 B.C.).

¹² *Digest of Justinian* 22.5.18; cf. also *Digest of Justinian* 12.2.3.3, 12.2.26.pr., 12.2.28.7, 12.2.30.2, etc.

¹³ Valerius Maximus, *Memorable Deeds and Sayings* 3.8.6, 8.2.3, and 8.3.

¹⁴ *Digest of Justinian* 3.1.1.5 (cf. 3.1.2-3). See the discussion, with numerous examples of women acting as lawyers in Roman courts during the Roman Republic, in: Richard Bauman, "Women in Law," *Women and Politics in Ancient Rome* (1992): pp. 45-52.

¹⁵ *Digest of Justinian* 48.2.

¹⁶ See the relevant entries in Adolf Berger, *Encyclopedic Dictionary of Roman Law* (1953), esp. "coemptio fiducia causa" (p. 393), "femina" (p. 469), "ius liberorum" (p. 530), "matrona" (p. 578), "meretrix" (p. 581), "testamenti factio" (pp. 732-33), "testis" (pp. 735-36), "tutela mulierum" (p. 748).

¹⁷ Gaius, *Institutes* 1.190-91.

¹⁸ Like many other Jewish sects, Christianity sold itself as specifically anti-Pharisee (e.g. Mark 2:18, 2:23-28, 3:1-6, 7:1-23, 10:2-12; Matthew 12:1-45, 15:1-14, 19:3-12, 23:1-36; Luke 5:30-33, 6:1-11, 11:37-54, 14:1-6, 16:14-18, 18:9-14; John 5:9-16; etc.), although these passages largely contain false caricatures of the actual

Pharisees, who were really closer in their teachings to the Christians than the Gospels reveal.

¹⁹ See Mishnah, *Sanhedrin* 3:3.

²⁰ From "Witness," *Encyclopedia Judaica*, vol. 16: (1971): p. 586.

²¹ Judith Wegner, *Chattel or Person? The Status of Women in the Mishnah* (1988): pp. 119-127.

²² Babylonian Talmud, *Gittin* 46a.

²³ Babylonian Talmud, *Sanhedrin* 24b-27b.

²⁴ On women testifying in court, see: Mishnah, *Ketubot* 1:6-7, 2:5-6; *Yebamot* 15:1-16:7; *Eduyyot* 3:6; and also: Babylonian Talmud, *Kiddushin* 65b, *Yebamot* 88b, *Sotah* 31b (and Mishnah, *Sotah* 6). On the general requirement of two witnesses (regardless of gender): Deuteronomy 17:6, 19:15; Matthew 18:16, 26:60; John 8:17; 1 Corinthians 13:1; 1 Timothy 5:19; Hebrews 10:28.

²⁵ Babylonian Talmud, *Mas. Sotah* 31b.

²⁶ See Mishnah, *Shabuot* 3:10-11, 5:1, 7:7-8.

²⁷ Mishnah, *Shabuot* 4:3-13.

²⁸ Babylonian Talmud, *Shevuot* 30a.

²⁹ Babylonian Talmud, *Shevuot* 30b.

³⁰ See: Mishnah, *Rosh Hashshanah* 1:3-2:3 and 2:5.

³¹ See: Mishnah, *Rosh Hashshanah* 2:6-2:8.

³² Babylonian Talmud, *Yebamot* 114b-115a.

³³ Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 4.219.

³⁴ See, for example, Richard Carrier, "The Burial of Jesus in Light of Jewish Law" and "The Plausibility of Theft," both in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus beyond the Grave*, eds. Jeff Lowder & Robert Price (2005): pp. 369-92 and pp. 349-68 (respectively).

Chapter 12 (Trusting Illiterate Laymen?)

¹ Septuagint text of Isaiah 61:1, quoted by Jesus in Luke 7:22.

² Babylonian Talmud, *Pesachim* 49a-b.

³ See “Am Ha-arez” in the *Encyclopedia Judaica*, vol. 2: pp. 833-36 (quote from p. 835).

Chapter 13 (Checked the Facts?)

¹ As I already discussed in Chapter 10, but see also Bruce Malina & Richard Rohrbaugh, *Social-Science Commentary on the Synoptic Gospels*, 2nd ed. (2003): pp. 366-68 (“Gossip”) and pp. 402-403 (“Secrecy”).

² Proverbs 11:13, 16:28, 17:9, 20:19, 25:9, 26:20 (respectively).

³ 1 Timothy 5:13 and 1 Peter 4:15 (*allotriepiskopos* = *allotrios* + *episkopos* = an overseer of someone else’s affairs).

⁴ As argued in Bruce Malina, *The New Testament World: Insights from Cultural Anthropology*, 3rd ed. (2001): pp. 40-42.

⁵ See notes in Chapter 10 for Malina and DeSilva’s books on this subject (the sociology of the early Christian mission).

⁶ 1 Corinthians 9:20-23.

⁷ In Herodotus’ *Histories* he mentions sources or methods: e.g. 2.123; 1.5, 4.195; names sources: e.g. 1.20-21, 2.29, 4.14, 4.29, 5.86-87, 6.53-54, 8.55, 8.65; gives different accounts: e.g. 1.3-5,

2.20-27, 5.86-87, 6.53-54, 7.148-152; expresses skepticism: e.g. 2.45, 3.16, 4.25, 4.31, 4.42, 4.95-96, 4.105, 5.86, 7.152.

⁸ Herodotus, *Histories* 8.37-38, 8.55, 8.129, 7.57, and 9.120 (respectively).

⁹ For example, see: Stephanie Lynn Budin, *The Myth of Sacred Prostitution in Antiquity* (2008); Thomas Harrison, *Divinity and History: The Religion of Herodotus* (2000); François Hartog, *The Mirror of Herodotus: The Representation of the Other in the Writing of History* (1988). See also: Nino Luraghi, *The Historian's Craft in the Age of Herodotus* (2001) and Donald Lateiner, *The Historical Method of Herodotus* (1989).

¹⁰ Observe: Acts 2:43, 3:1-11, 4:30-31, 5:1-16, 6:8, 8:7-13, 13:11-12, 14:3, 19:11-12, etc. On psychosomatic conditions in history see note 5 in Chapter 6.

¹¹ Acts 26:19 (cf. Acts 9:3-9, 22:6-11, 26:13-19; Galatians 1:11-12 & 1:15-16) and Acts 7:54-60.

¹² Justin Martyr, *Apology* 1.66 and *Dialogue of Justin and Trypho the Jew* 100-107. Justin cites the census records and the *Acts of Pilate* in *Apology* 1.34 & 1.35 (respectively).

¹³ On these statistics see André Lemaire, "Earliest Archaeological Evidence of Jesus Found in Jerusalem," *Biblical Archaeology Review* 28:6 (November/December 2002): pp. 25-33, 70.

¹⁴ Justin Martyr, *Apology* 1.31 (previous quote from 1.23). Note that the "letters" from emperors appended to the end of this apology are generally agreed to be forgeries (not necessarily by Justin).

¹⁵ Justin Martyr, *Dialogue of Justin and Trypho the Jew* 2 (conversion: 3-8; the venerability of scripture convinces him: 7-8). I thoroughly analyze the anti-scientific and anti-empirical elements of this and other early Christian literature in my forthcoming book *The Scientist in the Early Roman Empire*.

¹⁶ Justin Martyr, *Dialogue of Justin and Trypho the Jew* 30 & 39, respectively (on Judaism being the only plausible competitor to Christianity: 8-9).

¹⁷ Athenagoras, *A Plea for the Christians* 7 (that scripture is his only source of ‘evidence’, cf. 9-10).

¹⁸ For example, see Athenagoras, *A Plea for the Christians* 10.

¹⁹ Athenagoras, *Treatise on the Resurrection* 1-2.

²⁰ Athenagoras, *Treatise on the Resurrection* 12-15.

²¹ For example: Aristides, *Apology* 2 & 16. There is an extended Greek ‘quotation’ of Aristides in a work of later Christian fiction, which extensively ‘adds’ to the complete Syriac translation of the original speech. Scholars conclude the Greek extract is not a trustworthy version of the actual speech. On this and Aristides in general, see the scholarly introduction to “The Apology of Aristides the Philosopher,” by D.M. Kay in vol. 10 of the standard edition of the *Ante-Nicene Fathers*.

²² Tatian, *Address to the Greeks* 29.

²³ Tatian, *Address to the Greeks* 31-32.

²⁴ Tatian, *Address to the Greeks* 1-3 & 25-26.

²⁵ See, for example, Tatian, *Address to the Greeks* 35.

²⁶ This comes from introduction to Papias, *The Sayings of the Lord Explained*, as quoted in Eusebius, *History of the Church* 3.39.3-4. Eusebius rightly concludes (ibid. § 1-2 & 5-7) that Aristion and this presbyter John were not witnesses, but students of witnesses, and thus disciples only by pedigree.

²⁷ From Papias, *The Sayings of the Lord Explained*, as quoted in Irenaeus, *Against Heresies* 5.33.4.

²⁸ Eusebius, *History of the Church* 3.39.13 (in 3.39.11, Eusebius records that oral tradition was the only source Papias had or trusted).

Chapter 14 (Following an Ignorant Savior?)

¹ Mark 13:32 (“But of that day or that hour no one knows, not even the angels in heaven, neither the Son, but only the Father”); Luke 8:43-48 (“Who touched me?”), although the latter doesn’t actually say Jesus didn’t know who it was (rather than merely asking the culprit to fess up).

² See Chapter 1 and, e.g.: Romans 8:17; 2 Corinthians 1:5; 1 Peter 1:11, 2:21, 3:18, 4:1, 4:13, 5:1; Hebrews 2:9 & 13:12.

15. Who Would Follow an Executed Criminal?

[No notes fot this chapter.]

Chapter 16 (Teachings Too Radical?)

¹ Apuleius, *Metamorphoses* 11.21-25.

² Apuleius, *Metamorphoses* 11.23.

³ Apuleius, *Metamorphoses* 11.16.

⁴ Bruce Malina & Richard Rohrbaugh, *Social-Science Commentary on the Synoptic Gospels*, 2nd ed. (2003): p. 414 (“Surrogate Family”), emphasis added.

⁵ Richard Carrier, “Whence Christianity? A Meta-Theory for the Origins of Christianity,” *Journal of Higher Criticism* 11.1 (Spring 2005): 22-34.

Chapter 17 (Encouraged Critical Inquiry?)

¹ On prophecy as an ongoing phenomenon in the Church of Paul's day see: Romans 12:6 and 1 Corinthians 11:4-5, 13:9, 14:1-39.

² **Moral Virtues as Criterion:** 2 Corinthians 11:23-27, 12:7-10; 1 Thessalonians 1:5. **Scripture as Authoritative:** Romans 15:4, 16:25-26; 1 Corinthians 4:6, 15:3-4; 2 Timothy 3:15-16. **Revelation as Authoritative:** 1 Corinthians 2:6-16, 12:8, 13:2; 2 Corinthians 12:7-9; Galatians 2:1-2 (note how Paul occasionally distinguishes between his opinion and instructions from God, e.g. 1 Corinthians 7:12, 7:25 vs. 14:37), see also Ephesians 3 & 2 Peter 1:16-18 (plus examples in Acts of trusting visions: 7:55-56, 10:1-7, 11:5-14, 12:6-11, 16:9-10, 22:17-21).

Miracles as Criterion: 1 Corinthians 2:4-5 ("my speech and my preaching were *not* in persuasive words of wisdom, but in demonstration of the *spirit* and of *power*, so your faith would not stand on the wisdom of men, but on the power of God," emphasis mine); 2 Corinthians 12:12 ("truly the signs of an Apostle were wrought among you in all patience, by signs and wonders and mighty works"); 1 Thessalonians 1:5 ("how that our gospel came to you not in word only, but also in power, and in the Holy Spirit, and in much assurance, even as you know what manner of men we showed ourselves toward you for your sake"); Hebrews 2:3-4 ("what was spoken through the Lord, was confirmed to us by them that heard, and God bore witness with them, both by signs and wonders, and by manifold powers, and by gifts of the Holy Spirit, according to his own will").

³ Galatians 1:7-9 (emphasis mine).

⁴ Galatians 1:11-17 (emphasis mine).

⁵ 1 Timothy 6:3-4.

⁶ 1 Corinthians 2:1-5.

⁷ 2 Timothy 2:7 (e.g. Mark 13:11; Luke 12:11-12, 21:13-15).

⁸ 1 Corinthians 12:8-10.

⁹ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 1.9-10. Galen made a similar observation about Christians in *On the Different Kinds of Pulses* 2.4 & 3.3 (= Kühn 8.579 & 8.657) and elsewhere, cf. Richard Walzer, *Galen on Jews and Christians* (1949).

¹⁰ See www.tektonics.org/lp/nwjcarr17.html.

Chapter 18 (How Successful Was Christianity?)

¹ For the most thorough scholarly analysis of this dubious passage, with a current bibliography, see: James Carleton Paget, "Some Observations on Josephus and Christianity," *The Journal of Theological Studies* 52.2 (October 2001): pp. 539-624.

² Acts 13:46-48, 18:6, 28:24-31.

³ For Unnamed Christian sects condemned in the New Testament: Galatians 1:6-9; 1 Corinthians 1:12, 3:4-6; 2 Corinthians 11:4, 13; 2 Thessalonians 2:2-5, 15; 1 Timothy 4:1-3, 7, 5:15; 2 Timothy 2:16-18, 3:4-7, 9-10, 13-14; 2 Peter 2:1-3, 3:16; 1 John 4:1; Jude 3-4, 8-16; Romans 16:17-18; Philemon 1:15-17; Hebrews 13:8-9.

⁴ Tacitus, *Annals* 15.44.

⁵ Suetonius, *Life of Claudius* 25.4.

⁶ Suetonius identifies Christians correctly when he mentions their persecution under Nero in *Life of Nero* 16.2.

⁷ Cassius Dio, *Roman History* 67.14; Suetonius, *Domitian* 10. Later Christian legend invented versions of this event in which the victims were Christians, but these are exposed as fictions by the earlier versions in Dio and Suetonius.

⁸ Revelation 7:4 & 14:1-3.

⁹ Sulpicius Severus, *Chronicals* 2.30.6-8. The strongest advocate for Tacitean authorship of this passage is Eric Laupot in "Tacitus' Fragment 2: The Anti-Roman Movement of the *Christiani* and the Nazoreans," *Vigiliae Christianae* 54.3 (2000): pp. 233-47. Though he thinks a different group was meant (and 'Christians' was simply a confusion), Laupot's arguments are still multiply flawed. See Richard Carrier, "Severus Is Not Quoting Tacitus: A Rebuttal to Eric Laupot" (The Secular Web: 2006) at www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/laupot.html.

¹⁰ See Orosius, *History Against the Pagans* 7.9.4-6.

¹¹ See Acts 16:16-40, 17:5-9, 18:12-19, 19:23-41, 21:27-23:25.

¹² See Richard Carrier, "The Plausibility of Theft" in *The Empty Tomb: Jesus beyond the Grave*, eds. Jeff Lowder & Robert Price

(2005): pp. 350-51, and p. 365 n. 4. See also Richard Carrier, "The Nazareth Inscription" (The Secular Web: 2000) at www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/nazarethlaw.html.

¹³ See Pliny the Younger, *Epistles* 10.96-97.

¹⁴ See Pliny the Younger, *Epistles* 10.34. On the legal status of Christians (as well as the crime of illegal association) see: Naphtali Lewis & Meyer Reinhold, *Roman Civilization: Selected Readings*, 3rd ed., vol. 2 (1990): § 51-52 (see also § 169 and n. 37 in § 68); Timothy Barnes, "Legislation Against the Christians," *Journal of Roman Studies* 58 (1968): pp. 32-50; W.H.C. Frend, "Martyrdom and Political Oppression," *The Early Christian World*, vol. 1, ed. Philip Esler (2000): pp. 815-39.

¹⁵ Pliny the Younger, *Epistles* 10.96.6.

¹⁶ Pliny the Younger, *Epistles* 10.96.1-2.

¹⁷ See "Pliny (2) the Younger" in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (1996): p. 1198. That Pliny had already served as governor of Bithynia for well over a year: Pliny the Younger, *Letters* 10.15, 10.17b, and 10.88.

¹⁸ Rodney Stark, *The Rise of Christianity* (1996): pp. 4-13. I have seen estimates as high as 120 million for the total population of the Roman Empire, but never lower than 60 million (the number Stark accepts), and of course the population no doubt fluctuated, especially during famines and plagues, of which there were a few catastrophic examples in the first three centuries. I will assume the figure of 60 million is more or less correct.

¹⁹ W.V. Harris, ed., *The Spread of Christianity in the First Four Centuries: Essays in Explanation* (2005). See also Jack Sanders, *Charisma, Converts, Competitors: Societal and Sociological Factors in the Success of Early Christianity* (2000): pp. 135-59.

²⁰ Bruce Malina, in a book review (of Rodney Stark's *The Rise of Christianity*) in *The Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 59 (1997): pp. 593-595.

²¹ Keith Hopkins, "Christian Number and Its Implications," *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 6.2 (1998): pp. 185-226. Hopkins

also wrote a clever and fascinating work of historical fiction, *A World Full of Gods: The Strange Triumph of Christianity* (2001), on ancient religion and the means Christianity used to exploit popular religious culture to its own advantage.

²² Thomas Finn, "Mission and Expansion," *The Early Christian World*, vol. 1, ed. Philip Esler (2000): pp. 295-315; and Robin Lane Fox, *Pagans & Christians* (1987): pp. 268-69 (for later centuries: pp. 314-17).

²³ Origen, *Contra Celsum* 8.69.

²⁴ Eusebius, *History of the Church* 6.43.11.

²⁵ John Polhill, *Acts: The New American Commentary* (1992): pp. 49-50.

²⁶ Richard Rohrbaugh, "The Jesus Tradition: The Gospel Writers' Strategies of Persuasion," *The Early Christian World*, vol. 1, ed. Philip Esler (2000): pp. 218-19, pp. 211-14, and pp. 209-10.

²⁷ Ben Witherington III, *The Acts of the Apostles: A Socio-Rhetorical Commentary* (1998): p. 55.

²⁸ See: Margaret Williams, "VII.2. Pagans Sympathetic to Judaism" and "VII.3. Pagan Converts to Judaism" in *The Jews Among the Greeks and Romans: A Diasporan Sourcebook* (1998): pp. 163-79.

²⁹ Robin Lane Fox accomplishes a superb survey of the social marketing of early Christianity in *Pagans & Christians* (1987): esp. pp. 293-96, 299-304, 308-11, 317-18, 330 (Fox also defends the same theory I do, e.g. pp. 334-35; on Judaized pagans and Diaspora Jews as main targets: pp. 318-19). Jack Sanders *Charisma, Converts, Competitors: Societal and Sociological Factors in the Success of Early Christianity*, (2000): pp. 135-59 (Sanders also corrects many of the errors or over-simplifications made by Rodney Stark, although caution is still in order: Sanders still fails to distinguish the wider audience of Gentiles from Gentiles who were already sympathetic to and thus socially connected with Judaism, and he often conflates historical periods in his analysis, except when he discusses the changing fortunes of women within Christianity).

³⁰ See Gilbert Garraghan, *A Guide to Historical Method* (1946): §149a.

³¹ See works by Hopkins and Fox cited in notes above.

³² For quick surveys of everything that follows: John Drinkwater, "Maximinus to Diocletian and the 'Crisis'," *The Cambridge Ancient History, Vol. 12: The Crisis of Empire, AD 193-337*, 2nd ed. (2005): pp. 28-66; "The Third Century," Mary Boatwright, et al., *The Romans: From Village to Empire* (2004): pp. 431-58; "The Crisis of the Empire in the Third Century," M. Cary & H. Scullard, *A History of Rome down to the Reign of Constantine*, 3rd ed. (1975): pp. 507-16; and the introduction to Averil Cameron's *The Later Roman Empire: A.D. 284-430* (1993): pp. 1-12 (see also the works listed there on pp. 209-10). For more detail: Stephen Williams, *Diocletian and the Roman Recovery* (1997); Pat Southern, *The Roman Empire from Severus to Constantine* (2001); and Michael Grant, *The Collapse and Recovery of the Roman Empire* (1999). On details and evidence regarding the collapse of the economy, see: Dominic Rathbone, "Prices and Price Formation in Roman Egypt," *Economie Antique: Prix et Formation Des Prix Dans Les Economies Antiques*, eds. Jean Andreau, Pierre Briant and Raymond Descat (1997): pp. 183-244.

³³ See, for example, Roger Finke & Rodney Stark, *The Churching of America, 1776-1990: Winners and Losers in Our Religious Economy* (1993).
