

Bibliography for
HITLER HOMER BIBLE CHRIST
The Historical Papers of Richard Carrier 1995–2013

RICHARD CARRIER
Ph.D.

Philosophy Press
2014

Copyright © 2014 Richard Carrier
Additional copyrights noted below.

All rights reserved.

QUICK LINKS

Click the chapter number to go to that chapter's title and a statement of copyrights and where it first appeared. If a chapter has bibliographies, those links appear below each chapter number on this quick link list.

Chapter 1

(no bibliography)

Chapter 2

(no bibliography)

Chapter 3

[\(brief bibliography\)](#)

Chapter 4

(no bibliography)

Chapter 5

[\(bibliography of ancient works cited\)](#)

[\(bibliography of scholarship cited\)](#)

Chapter 6

(no bibliography)

Chapter 7

[\(passages cited\)](#)

[\(scholarship cited\)](#)

Chapter 8

[\(passages cited\)](#)

[\(scholarship cited\)](#)

Chapter 9

[\(bibliography\)](#)

Chapter 10

(no bibliography)

Chapter 11

(no bibliography)

Chapter 12

([bibliography](#))

Chapter 13

(no bibliography)

Chapter 14

([brief bibliography](#))

Chapter 15

([expanded report](#))

([passages cited](#))

([bibliography](#))

Chapter 16

([passages cited](#))

([scholarship cited](#))

Chapter 17

([passages cited](#))

([scholarship cited](#))

Chapter 18

([passages cited](#))

([scholarship cited](#))

Chapter 19

([passages cited](#))

([scholarship cited](#))

Chapter 20

([passages cited](#))

([scholarship cited](#))

Appendix: [List of Richard Carrier's Books and Chapters](#)

CHAPTER 1

THE FUNCTION OF THE HISTORIAN IN SOCIETY

Was originally published in *The History Teacher* 35.4 (August 2002): 519-26. Reproduced with permission.

CHAPTER 2

HISTORY BEFORE 1950

Was originally published at Richard Carrier Blogs 30 April 2007. Revised. Copyright 2003, 2007, and 2014.

CHAPTER 3

EXPERIMENTAL HISTORY

Was originally published at Richard Carrier Blogs 28 July 2007. Revised. Copyright 2007 and 2014.

In the print edition, drawings were included showing the oar arrangements discussed in the text, depicting ancient ships in cross section. Those were reproduced from Foley and Soedel's article in *Scientific American*. Images copyright © 1981 by George volume Kelvin. They were used with his permission.

The theory that some of the stones in the Egyptian pyramids were made of poured concrete was published under peer review in M.W. Barsoum, A. Ganguly & G. Hug, "Microstructural Evidence of Reconstituted Limestone Blocks in the Great Pyramids of Egypt," *Journal of the American Ceramic Society* 89.12 (2006): 3788–96). (So far the only expert rebuttals I've seen are straw manning the argument, by testing the wrong stones, and mistakenly assuming the proposal is that *all* of a pyramid's stones were placed this way, which neither Davidovits nor Barsoum have ever claimed.)

CHAPTER 4

B.C.A.D.C.E.B.C.E.

Was originally published at Richard Carrier Blogs
6 January 2012. Revised. Copyright 2012 and 2014.

CHAPTER 5

HEROIC VALUES IN CLASSICAL LITERARY DEPICTIONS OF THE SOUL: HEROES AND GHOSTS IN VIRGIL, HOMER, AND TSO CH'IU-MING

Was originally published at RichardCarrier.info in 2013.
Copyright 1997, 2004, and 2013.

Works Cited:

Countless passages were quoted or referenced from the *Aeneid*, *Iliad*, *Odyssey* and *Tso Chuan*, too many to name here, as such a collection of passage numbers would be extremely arduous to navigate through. If you want to identify and read them, the only efficient procedure for the visually impaired is for an assistant reader to consult the print edition and then locate the passages and read them for you from a standard edition, online or in print, of each ancient author. Here I will only list the ancient authors and works cited. If you want to skip this list of passage numbers, click [here](#) to go directly to the modern scholarship used in this chapter. Otherwise, the alphabetical list of ancient works cited reads as follows:

Caesar, *De Bello Civili*.

Cicero, *De Inventione*.

Cicero, *De Legibus*.

Cicero, *De Republica*.

Cicero, *Philippics*.

Cicero, *Pro Cnaeo Plancio*.

Cicero, *Pro Sestio*.

Cleanthes, *Hymn to Zeus*.

Confucius, *Analects*.

Herodotus, *Histories*.

Hesiod, *Shield of Herakles*.

Homer, *The Iliad*.

Homer, *The Odyssey*.

Juvenal, *Satires*.

Ovid, *Fasti*.

Pausanias, *Description of Greece*.

Pindar, *Olympian Odes*.

Plato, *Cratylus*.

Plato, *The Laws*.

Plato, *Phaedo*.

Pliny the Elder, *Natural History*.

Plutarch, *Coriolanus*.

Plutarch, *How the Young Man Should Study Poetry*.

Servius, *Commentary on the Aeneid*.

Tso Ch'iu-ming, *Tso Chuan*.

Valerius Maximus, *Memorable Deeds and Sayings*.

Virgil, *The Aeneid*.

Bibliography for Heroic Values:

- Ames, Roger T. 1984. The Meaning of Body in Classical Chinese Thought. *International Philosophical Quarterly* 24(1): 39-53.
- Barry, H. I. Child and M. Bacon. 1959. Relation of Child Training to Subsistence Economy. *American Anthropologist* 61: 51-63.

- Berry, J. 1976. *Human Ecology and Cognitive Style: Comparative Studies in Cultural and Psychological Adaptation*. New York: Sage.
- Berry, J. and R. Annis. 1974. Ecology, Culture and Differentiation. *International Journal of Psychology* 9: 173-93.
- Bond, M, editor 1996. *The Handbook of Chinese Psychology*. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.
- Bower, Bruce. 1997. My Culture, My Self: Western Notions of the Mind may not Translate to Other Cultures. *Science News* (18 October): pages 248-9.
- . 1998. Teens Put Cultured Spin on Friendship. *Science News* (8 August): 84.
- . 2000. Cultures of Reason: Thinking Styles may Take Eastern and Western Routes. *Science News* (22 January): 56-8.
- Cary, M. and H.H. Scullard. 1975. *A History of Rome Down to the Reign of Constantine*, 3rd editor Hong Kong: St. Martin's Press.
- Cheng, Anne. 1993. *Ch'un ch'in, Kung yang, Ku liang and Tso Chuan. Early Chinese Texts*. Michael Loewe, editor Berkeley: Institute of East Asian Studies. 69ff.
- Chien-shih, Shen. 1936-7. An Essay on the Primitive Meaning of the Character [Kuei]. *Monumenta Serica* 2: 1-20.
- Cohen, Alvin page 1971. *The Avenging Ghost: Moral Judgement in Chinese Historical Texts*. Dissertation: University of California at Berkeley.
- Cribiore, Raffaella. 2001. *Gymnastics of the Mind: Greek Education in Hellenistic and Roman Egypt*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- . 1996. *Writing, Teachers, and Students in Graeco-Roman Egypt*. Atlanta: Scholars Press.
- Cromer, Alan. 1993. *Uncommon Sense: The Heretical Nature of Science*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Davison, J.A. 1962. *The Homeric Question. A Companion to Homer*. A.J.B. Wace and F. Stubbings, editors New York: St. Martin Press. 234-265.
- Falkner, Thomas M. 1995. *The Poetics of Old Age in Greek Epic, Lyric, and Tragedy*. University of Oklahoma Press.
- Forke, Alfred, tr. 1962. *Lun-Heng: Philosophical Essays of Wang Ch'ung*. New York: Paragon Book Gallery (unaltered reprint from 1907).
- Garrison, James D. 1992. *Pietas From Vergil to Dryden*. University Park, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Glare, G.W. 1997. *Oxford Latin Dictionary*. Oxford University Press. [pages 2073, 1378, 1384]
- Gwynn, Aubrey. 1926. *Roman Education from Cicero to Quintilian*. New York: Russell and Russell.
- Hammond, Martin, tr. 1987. *Homer: The Iliad*. London: Penguin.
- Hansen, C. 1983. *Language and Logic in Ancient China*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- Heine, Steven and Darrin Lehman. 1997a. The Cultural Construction of Self-Enhancement: An Examination of Group-Serving Biases. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 72(6): 1268-83.
- Heine, Steven and Darrin Lehman. 1997b. Culture, Dissonance, and Self-Affirmation. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* April: 389-400.

- Hsu, F. 1981. *Americans and Chinese: Passage to Differences*, 3rd editor Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Hui, H. and H. Triandis. 1986. Individualism-Collectivism: A Study of Cross-Cultural Research. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology* 17: 225-48.
- Hurwitt, Jeffrey. 1985. *The Art and Culture of Early Greece: 1100-480 B.C.* Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Ji, Li-jun, Norbert Schwarz, and Richard Nisbett. 2000. Culture, Autobiographical Memory, and Behavioral Frequency Reports: Measurement Issues in Cross-Cultural Studies. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* 26(5): 585-93.
- Johnston, Sarah Iles. 1999. *Restless Dead: Encounters Between the Living and the Dead in Ancient Greece*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Karlgren, Bernhard. 1957. *Grammata Serica Recensa*. Stockholm: Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities. [Entries cited in this volume are numbered 284b, 468t]
- Keightley, David N. 1983. *The Hero, Art, and Culture: Early China and Early Greece*. Unpublished manuscript.
- . 1985. *Dead but not Gone: Cultural Implications of Mortuary Practice in Neolithic and Early Bronze Age China, ca. 8000 to 1000 B.C.* Unpublished manuscript.
- . 1990. Early Civilization in China: Reflections on How it Became Chinese. *Heritage of China*. Paul Ropp, editor Berkeley: University of California Press.
- . 1993. Clean Hands and Shining Helmets: Heroic Action in Early Chinese and Greek Culture. *Religion and the Authority of the Past*. Tobin Siebers, editor University of Michigan Press.
- Keller, M. et al. 1998. Reasoning About Responsibilities and Obligations in Close Relationships: A Comparison Across Two Cultures. *Developmental Psychology* 34(4): 731-41.
- Kierman, Frank Jr. 1974. Phases and Modes of Combat in Early China. *Chinese Ways in Warfare*. Frank Kierman, Jr., and John Fairbank, editors Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. 27-66.
- Kitayama, Shinobu et al. 1997. Individual and Collective Processes in the Construction of the Self: Self-Enhancement in the United States and Self-Criticism in Japan. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 72(6): 1245-67.
- Kopff, E. C. 1999. *The Devil Knows Latin: Why America Needs the Classical Tradition*. Wilmington, Delaware: Intercollegiate Studies Institute.
- Legge, James, tr. 1970. *The Ch'un Ts'ew with the Tso Chuen. The Chinese Classics: With a Translation, Critical and Exegetical Notes, Prolegomena, and Copious Indexes* 5. Hong Kong University Press (updated reprint from 1872).
- Lewis, C. and C. Short. 1995. *A Latin Dictionary*. New York: Oxford University Press (reprint from 1879). [pages 1997, 1381, 1374]
- Liddell, H.G. and R. Scott. 1996. *An Intermediate Greek-English Lexicon*, 9th editor New York: Oxford University Press (reprint from 1940). [In the order that definitions of Greek words are mentioned: pages 115, 116, and 906-907, especially sections I.2 and IV, and pages 903, 226, 227, 140, also 870, section II, and pages 528, 401, 43, also 498, and pages 487, 871, 140,]
- Liu, James. 1967. *The Chinese Knight-Errant*. University of Chicago Press.
- Lloyd, G.E.R. 2002. *The Ambitions of Curiosity: Understanding the World in Ancient Greece and China*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- . 1996. *Adversaries and Authorities: Investigations into Ancient Greek and Chinese Science*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- . 1990. *Demystifying Mentalities*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Loewe, Michael, editor 1993. *Early Chinese Texts: A Bibliographical Guide*. Berkeley, CA: Institute of East Asian Studies.
- MacDonald, Dennis R. 2000. *The Homeric Epics and the Gospel of Mark*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Maltby, Robert. 1991. *A Lexicon of Ancient Latin Etymologies*. Leeds, Great Britain: Francis Cairns.
- Markus, H. and S. Kitayama. 1991. Culture and the Self: Implications for Cognition, Emotion, and Motivation. *Psychological Review* 98: 224-53.
- Marrou, Henri. 1948. *Histoire de l'Education dans l'Antiquite*, 3rd editor (tr. as: *A History of Education in Antiquity*, 1986. Madison, Wis.: University of Wisconsin Press).
- Mathews, R.H. 1943. *Mathews' Chinese-English Dictionary*. Harvard University Press.
- Morgan, Teresa. 1998. *Literate Education in the Hellenistic and Roman Worlds*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Moser, D.J. 1996. *Abstract Thinking and Thought in Ancient Chinese and Early Greek*. Dissertation: University of Michigan.
- Nagy, Gregory. 1996. *Homeric Questions*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Nakamura, H. 1964. *Ways of Thinking of Eastern Peoples*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Nisbett, Richard, Li-Jun Ji, and Kaiping Peng. 2000. Culture, Control, and the Perception of Relationships in the Environment. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 78(5): 943-55.
- Saller, Richard page 1994. *Pietas and patria potestas. Patriarchy, Property and Death in the Roman Family*. Cambridge University Press.
- Schein, Seth L. 1984. *The Mortal Hero: An Introduction to Homer's Iliad*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Schuessler, Alex. 1987. *Dictionary of Early Zhou Chinese*. University of Hawaii Press.
- Shea, Christopher. 2001. White Men Can't Contextualize. *Lingua Franca* September: 44-51.
- Shelton, Jo-Ann. 1998. *As The Romans Did: A Sourcebook in Roman Social History*, 2nd editor New York: Oxford University Press.
- Shewring, Walter , tr. 1980. *Homer: The Odyssey*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Smith, D. Howard. 1958. Chinese Concepts of the Soul. *Numen: International Review for the History of Religions* 5(3): 165-179.
- Sourvinou-Inwood, Christiane. 1995. *'Reading' Greek Death to the End of the Classical Period*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Suetoshi, Ikeda. 1956. *Revue bibliographique de Sinologie* 2: no. 525.
- Triandis, H. 1989. The Self and Social Behavior in Differing Cultural Contexts. *Psychological Review* 96: 506-20.
- Tucker, T. G. 1931. *A Concise Etymological Dictionary of Latin*. Halle, Germany: Max Niemeyer Verlag.

- Turner, Frank. 1981. *The Greek Heritage in Victorian Britain*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Wang, C.H. 1975. Towards Defining a Chinese Heroism. *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 95(1): 25-35.
- Watson, Burton, tr. 1989. *The Tso Chuan: Selections from China's Oldest Narrative History*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Wetmore, Monroe Nichols. 1911. *Index Verborum Vergilianus*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Whiting, J. and I. Child. 1953. *Child Training and Personality: A Cross-Cultural Study*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Williams, R. D., editor 1992. *The Aeneid of Virgil: Books 1-6*. Thomas Nelson and Sons.
- Witkin, H. and J. Berry. 1975. Psychological Differentiation in Cross-Cultural Perspective. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology* 6: 4-87.
- Witkin, H. and D. Goodenough. 1977. Field Dependence and Interpersonal Behavior. *Psychological Bulletin* 84: 661-89.
- Wolf, Arthur. 1974. Gods, Ghosts, and Ancestors. *Religion and Ritual in Chinese Society*. Arthur Wolf, editor Stanford University Press. 131-182.
- Ying-shih, Yü. 1987. 'Oh Soul, Come Back!' A Study in the Changing Conceptions of the Soul and Afterlife in Pre-Buddhist China. *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 47(2): 363-395.

CHAPTER 6

HEROD THE PROCURATOR AND CHRISTIAN APOLOGETICS

Was originally a work of educational humor
published at Richard Carrier Blogs on 6 January 2012.
Revised. Copyright 2012 and 2014.

CHAPTER 7

HEROD THE PROCURATOR: WAS HEROD THE GREAT A ROMAN GOVERNOR OF SYRIA?

Was prepared by Richard Carrier as his Master of Philosophy thesis in the year 2000.
Revised and published at RichardCarrier.info in 2012.
Copyright 2000 and 2012.

Passages Cited in Herod the Procurator (in the order cited or employed): (click [here](#) to skip to scholarship cited)

BJ [= *Jewish War*] 1.399-400, *AJ* [= *Jewish Antiquities*] 15.354-361; content corroborated by Dio Cassius, *RH* [= *Roman History*] 54.7.4, 54.7.6, 54.9.3, and partly by the Augustus, *Res Gestae* 11, which notes the founding of the *Augustalia* in honor of Augustus' return from Syria in 19 B.C.

AJ 15.360 and *BJ* 1.399.

AJ 15.360 and *BJ* 1.399.

Appian, *Contra Apion* 1.50 (with *BJ* 1.pr.6).

Josephus, *AJ* 1.7, 1.5, 20.263.

FGrH §90, §236. [*FGrH* means *Fragmente der griechischen Historiker*, a collection of the fragments of often otherwise lost authors in ancient Greek]

AJ 14.178-80 and *BJ* 1.212-213.

AJ 14.278-84 and *BJ* 1.224-9.

BJ 1.194 and *AJ* 14.137 and 16.53.

BJ 2.123-135.

AJ 7.268 and 18.194 and *Life of Josephus* 126 and *BJ* 1.487.

AJ 10.5, 12.360, 15.65, 20.31 and *BJ* 1.209.

AJ 8.59, 8.162 and *BJ* 2.14.

AJ 9.247, 11.61, 12.221; and in Josephus, *Against Apion* 1.98 having the powers of an *epitropos* is distinguished from "all the other authority of a king."

AJ 17.69 and *BJ* 5.592.

AJ 19.276.

AJ 10.278, where the verbal form of *epitropos* is used to refer to divine providence (via God's stewardship of the universe).

AJ 15.360, 17.221, 20.107, etc.; and *BJ* 1.538, 2.16, 2.117, etc.

AJ 18.170, 19.292 and *BJ* 6.238, 7.9.

See *eparchos* in *AJ* 18.33, 19.363; and *hêgemôn* in *AJ* 18.55.

AJ 18.2 and *BJ* 2.117.

Claudius Ptolemy, *Geography* 5.14, and 15.18

AJ 13.355-6, 13.192; 14.79; 16.275; and *BJ* 1.103, 1.155.

BJ 1.213 and *AJ* 14.180.

Cassius Dio, *Roman History* 57.23.

Tacitus, *Annals* 4.6.

Pliny, *Panegyricus* 36.

Tacitus, *Annals* 4.15.

Augustus, *Res Gestae* 1, 3, 5, 15-24.

Pliny, *Epistles* 10.27

Philo, in *Flaccum* 3-4.

Josephus, *AJ* 18.60, *BJ* 2.175, etc.

BJ 7.216.

Tacitus, *Annals* 4.15, 12.49, 12.54, 12.60, 14.32, 14.38-39, and 15.44.

Tacitus, *Annals* 16.16 and 4.33.

Cassius Dio, *RH* 54.7-10.

Additional Bibliography for Herod the Procurator (in the order cited or employed):

(You will notice many cited and quoted sources are in French or German. In the text itself, except where noted, all translations from that German and French scholarship are my own.)

Samuel Sandmel, *Herod: Profile of a Tyrant* (1967).

For a case similar to mine, see Anthony Barrett, "Herod, Augustus, and the Special Relationship: The Significance of the Procuratorship," in *Herod and Augustus: Papers Presented at the IJS Conference, 21st-23rd June 2005* (2009), David Jacobson and Nikos Kokkinos, editors, pages 281-302.

The most thorough treatment of the issue of Augustan procurators, verifying the conclusions here to be drawn, is Peter Eich, *Zur Metamorphose des politischen Systems in der römischen Kaiserzeit: die Entstehung einer "personalen Bürokratie" im langen dritten Jahrhundert* (2005), especially pages 106-58.

Also Werner Eck, *Rom und Judaea: Fünf Vorträge zur römischen Herrschaft in Palaestina* (Mohr Siebeck, 2007), pages 24-48.

Benedict Niese, *Flavii Josephi Opera*, 6 volumes (1887-1894).

S. Naber, *Flavii Iosephi Opera Omnia*, 6 volumes (1888-1896).

Steve Mason, editor, *Flavius Iosephus: Translation and Commentary*, volume 3 (2000) (including remarks by Louis Feldman in the preface). This began with volume 3 (out of sequence) in 2000, containing books 1-to-4 of the *AJ*, with translation and commentary by Louis Feldman; other volumes have followed, unfortunately many still out of sequence, and the relevant books for our purposes have not been completed. In 2008, volume “1b” was published containing only book 2 of the *BJ*; and the *AJ* has been brought up only to book 10 (in volume 5, released in 2005).

Etienne Nodet, *Les antiquités juives* (1992-2010), has not yet reached even book 12 of the *AJ*, and the apparatus is minimal and thus not encouraging.

L. Dindorf, *Flavii Iosephi Opera* (1865).

J. Hudson & S. Haverkamp, *Flavii Iosephi Opera Omnia*, 1726, a revision of Hudson’s earlier *Flavii Iosephi Opera Quae Reperiri Potuerunt Omnia* (1720).

H. Thackeray and R. Marcus, *Iosephus in Nine Volumes*, volume 1 (1926), pages xvii-xviii (i.e. the Loeb edition).

Per Bilde, *Flavius Iosephus between Jerusalem and Rome: His Life, His Works, and Their Importance* (1988), pages 132-133, 142-143.

Theodore Lodge, *The Famous and Memorable Workes of Iosephus* (1632), pages 407 and 586.

Ebenezer Thompson & W.C. Price, *The Works of Flavius Iosephus* (1777), Volume 1, page 604 and Volume 2, page 238.

S. Haverkamp & J. Hudson, *Flavii Iosephi Hebraei Opera Omnia* (1782), Volume 2, page 610-611.

William Whiston, *The Works of Flavius Iosephus* (1839), Volume 2, page 544 and Volume 3, page 381.

The *Complete Works of Iosephus* (1924), a quote “new and revised edition based on Haverkamp’s translation,” end quote, is actually a verbatim copy of Whiston, who employed Haverkamp’s text; cf. Volume 2, page 555 and Volume 3, page 464.

The *AJ* passage was translated by Ralph Marcus and edited by Allen Wilkgren when Thackeray’s death prevented its completion; here quoted from *Iosephus in Ten Volumes*, Volume 8 (1963), page 175; the *BJ* passage was translated by Thackeray, here quoted from *Iosephus in Nine Volumes*, Volume 2 (1927), page 189.

G.A. Williamson, *The Jewish War* (1959), page 74.

Gaalya Cornfeld, *Iosephus: The Jewish War, Newly Translated with Extensive Commentary & Archaeological Background Illustrations* (1982), page 76.

Heinrich Clementz, *Des Flavius Iosephus Jüdische Altertümer*, Bild 2 (1959; orig. 1900), page 353.

Heinrich Clementz, *Geschichte des Jüdischen Krieges* (1923), page 114.

Alexander Berendts and Konrad Grass, *Vom Jüdischen Kriege Buch I-IV* (1924), page 138.

Otto Michel & Otto Bauernfeind, *Der Jüdische Krieg* (1960), page 107.

See “Verweser” in Jacob Grimm & Wilhelm Grimm, *Deutsches Wörterbuch* (1956), especially section 1 and section 2a-c, for Latin equivalents and history of usage.

Hermann Endrös, *Der Jüdische Krieg* (1964), page 94.

André Pelletier, *Josèphe: Guerre des Juifs* (1975), volume 1, page 120.

Pierre Savinel, *La Guerre des Juifs* (1977), page 178.

Arnauld D'Andilly (adapted by J.A.C. Buchon), *Histoire Ancienne des Juifs & la Guerre des Juifs contre les Romains 66-70 ap. J.-C.* (1973), pages 489 and 671

Etienne Nodet, *Les Antiquités Juives*, begun in 1992; volume 5 with books 10 & 11 was published in 2010.

Théodore Reinach, *Oeuvres Complètes de Flavius Josèphe* (1900-1928), volume 3 (1904), page 347, and volume 5 (1912), page 80. The latter was revised by Reinach.

W. Horbury et al., *The Cambridge History of Judaism*, volume 3 (1999): pages 118-122

L.-M. Günther, *Herodes der Große* (2005): page 135.

Emil Schürer, *A History of the Jewish People in the Time of Jesus Christ* (1890), English translation by John MacPherson (1994), 1st division, volume 1, page 453.

Stewart Perowne, *The Life and Times of Herod the Great* (1959), page 146.

Solomon Zeitlin, *The Rise and Fall of the Judaeen State* (1967), volume 2, page 43.

Abraham Schalit, *König Herodes: Der Mann und sein Werk* (1969), page 327.

István Hahn, "Herodes als Prokurator," in Elisabeth Welskopf, editor, *Neue Beiträge zur Geschichte der Alten Welt, Bild II (Römisches Reich)* (1965), pages 25-43; presented at a conference in 1962. Only the first and last pages (25 and 35) address the appointment in 20 B.C., and only the last does so in any detail.

Michael Grant, *Herod the Great* (1971), page 149.

E. Mary Smallwood, *The Jews Under Roman Rule: From Pompey to Diocletian (A Study in Political Relations)* (1981), pages 87-88, and 45 and 47.

Uwe Baumann, *Rom und die Juden: Die römisch-jüdischen Beziehungen von Pompeius bis zum Tode des Herodes (63 v. Chr.-4 v. Chr.)* (1983), page 213.

Peter Richardson, *Herod: King of the Jews and Friend of the Romans* (1996), page 234.

Walter Otto, "Herodes," *Paulys Realencyclopädie der Classischen Altertumswissenschaft*, Supplement II (1913), page 71.

Contrast "Beamte" in the *Oxford-Duden German Dictionary* (1990), with that in the *Deutsches Wörterbuch* (1956).

Freedmen as imperial procurators: P.R.C. Weaver, "Freedmen Procurators in the Imperial Administration," *Historia: Zeitschrift für Alte Geschichte* 14.4 (October 1965), pages 460-69.

On both the private nature of royal wealth and the division of military and finance officers (*stratêgoi* and *oikonomoi*), cf. Peter Green, *Alexander to Actium: The Historical Evolution of the Hellenistic Age* (1990), pages 187-200.

On the Roman use of client kings and their armies (and Herod in particular) see Denis Saddington, "Client Kings' Armies under Augustus: The Case of Herod," in David Jacobson and Nikos Kokkinos, editors, *Herod and Augustus: Papers Presented at the IJS Conference, 21st-23rd June 2005* (2009), pages 303-23.

Abraham Schalit, *Scripta Hierosolymitana* 1 [1954], pages 64-77.

Gregory Bucher, "The Origins, Program, and Composition of Appian's *Roman History*," *TAPA* 130 (2000), pages 411-458.

V. Gardthausen, *Augustus und seine Zeit*, T.1 Bild2 (1896), page 818.

Joachim Marquardt, *Römische Staatsverwaltung*, Volume 1 (1881), page 408 (1975 Arno edition).

A.N. Sherwin-White, "Procurator Augusti," *Papers of the British School at Rome* 15 n.s. 2 (1939).

H.-G. Pflaum, *Les procureurs équestres sous la Haut-Empire romain* (1950).

A.H.M. Jones, "Procurators and Prefects in the Early Principate," *Studies in Roman Government and Law* (1960), page 123.

Fergus Millar, "Some Evidence on the Meaning of Tacitus *Annals* XII.60," *Historia: Zeitschrift für alte Geschichte* 13 (1964), pages 180-7.

William volume Harris, *War and Imperialism in Republican Rome: 327-70 B.C.* (1979).

V. Ehrenberg & A.H.M. Jones, *Documents Illustrating the Reigns of Augustus and Tiberius*, 2nd. editor (1976), section 369.

T. J. Luce, "Tacitus on 'History's Highest Function': *praecipuum munus annalium* (Ann. 3.65)," *Aufstieg und Niedergang der Römischen Welt* II.33.4 (1991), pages 2905-27.

E. Beaudoin, *Les grand domaines dans l'Empire romain* (1899), pages 178ff.

P.A. Brunt, "Procuratorial Jurisdiction," *Latomus* 25.3 (July-September 1966): pages 461-89.

CHAPTER 8

ON THE DUAL OFFICE OF PROCURATOR AND PREFECT

Originally published at RichardCarrier.info
Copyright 2012.

Passages Cited in Dual Office (in the order cited or employed): (click [here](#) to skip to scholarship cited)

Philo, *Embassy to Gaius* 38.299.

Inscriptiones Latinae Selectae 231.

Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum III 5776.

Additional Bibliography for Dual Office (in the order cited or employed):

Fergus Millar, "Some Evidence on the Meaning of Tacitus 'Annals XII'. 60," *Historia: Zeitschrift für Alte Geschichte* 13.2 (1964): pages 180-187 .

Fergus Millar, "The Development of Jurisdiction by Imperial Procurators: Further Evidence," *Historia: Zeitschrift für Alte Geschichte* 14.3 (1965): pages 362-667.

A.M.M. Jones, "Procurators and Prefects in the Early Principate," *Studies in Roman Government and Law* (1960) (I used a Basil Blackwell reprint of the 1960 text produced in 1968).

P.A.. Brunt, "Procuratorial Jurisdiction," *Latomus* 25.3 (July-September 1966): pages 461-89.

does not clearly mean the governor of Thrace, it could simply mean the procurator assigned to manage funds in Thrace, who might not have been the governor; and even if he was, he is here being referred to in his capacity as the manager of money and lands (for the building of roads), not in his capacity as the Thracian judicial and military authority. Thus we cannot conclude from this inscription that he was not also the prefect of Thrace.

K. Kraft, *Münchener Beiträge zur Vor- und Frühgeschichte* 7 (1964): pages 71–74.

H.-G. Pflaum, *Les carrières procuratoriennes équestres sous le Haut-Empire romain* (1960-1961), volume 3, pages 1044-99.

CHAPTER 9

FLASH! FOX NEWS REPORTS THAT ALIENS MAY HAVE BUILT THE PYRAMIDS OF EGYPT!

Was originally published in *Skeptical Inquirer* 23.5
(September-October 1999), pages 46-50.

Minor revisions copyright 2014 by Richard Carrier.

Original copyright 1999 by *The Skeptical Inquirer*.

Reproduced with permission.

Bibliography for Flash! (in the order cited or employed):

There was much discussion about this Fox special at the time: you can peruse the ANE Digest archives online around the date of broadcast at <http://oi.uchicago.edu/research/library/ane/digest>.

R.M. Schoch, "Redating the Great Sphinx of Giza," *KMT: A Modern Journal of Ancient Egypt* 3.2 (Summer 1992): pages 52-59, and 66-70.

T.L. Dobecki and R.M. Schoch, "Seismic Investigations in the Vicinity of the Great Sphinx of Giza, Egypt," *Geoarchaeology* 7.6 (1992): pages 527-44.

R.M. Schoch, "L'Age du Sphinx de Gizeh: Vers Une Revision Dechirante?" *Kadath: Chroniques des Civilisations Disparues* 81 (Winter 1993-1994): pages 13-53.

David Silverman, "The Curse of the Curse of the Pharaohs," *Expedition* 29.2 (1987): pages 56-63.

Robert Bianchi, "Pyramidiots," *Archaeology* 44 (November-December 1991): page 84.

Daniel Boorstin, "Afterlives of the Great Pyramids," *The Wilson Quarterly* 16 (Summer 1992): pages 130-38.

<http://www.bibliotecapleyades.net/egipto/abydos/abydos03.htm>.

Juergen von Beckerath, *Handbuch der aegyptischen Koenigsnamen* [Muenchner aegyptologische Studien 20 (1984)], pages 235-37.

Omm Sety and Hanny El Zeini, *Abydos: Holy City of Ancient Egypt* (1981), page 187.

Shafik Farid, editor, *The Temple at Abydos* (1983), page 8.

CHAPTER 10

PSEUDOHISTORY IN JERRY VARDAMAN'S MAGIC COINS: THE NONSENSE OF MICROGRAPHIC LETTERS

Originally published in the *Skeptical Inquirer* 26.2
(March-April 2002), pages 39-41, and 61.
Minor revisions copyright 2014 by Richard Carrier.
Original copyright 2002 by the *Skeptical Inquirer*.
Reproduced with permission.

CHAPTER 11

MORE ON VARDAMAN'S MICROLETTERS

Originally published in the *Skeptical Inquirer*
26.4 (July-August 2002), pages 60-61.
Minor revisions copyright 2014 by Richard Carrier.
Original copyright 2002 by the *Skeptical Inquirer*.
Reproduced with permission.

CHAPTER 12

HITLER'S *TABLE TALK*: TROUBLING FINDS

This article was first published in
German Studies Review 26.3 (October 2003): pages 561-76.
Minor revisions & new afterword copyright 2014 by Richard Carrier.
Original copyright 2003 by the German Studies Association.
Reprinted with permission from
Johns Hopkins University Press.

Bibliography for Hitler's *Table Talk* (in the order cited or employed):

Jonathan Glover, *Humanity: A Moral History of the Twentieth Century* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1999), pages 355-56.

Apart from still more changes of title, publisher, and publication date than are noted here, the following survey exhausts all major variants of Hitler's *Table Talk* that I know:

First appeared the German version of Henry Picker in 1951 (1st edition, with Gerhard Ritter; 2nd edition with Percy Schramm in 1963; 3rd edition in 1976) entitled *Hitlers Tischgespräche im Führerhauptquartier, 1941-42* (1st edition: Bonn: Athenaeum-Verlag; 2nd & 3rd editions: Stuttgart: Seewald).

In 1952 came the French version of François Genoud, *Libres Propos sur la Guerre et la Paix: Recueillis sur l'Ordre de Martin Bormann* (Paris: Flammarion).

Then in 1953 arrives the English version edited by H.R. Trevor-Roper, *Hitler's Table Talk, 1941-1944* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicholson), also published as *Hitler's Secret Conversations, 1941-1944*. Reprinted many times (e.g. 1961, 1988), a new (2nd) edition was issued in 1973, and a 3rd edition in 2000 [and in reaction to this article, a 4th edition was released in 2007 with a new preface by renowned Hitler historian Gerhard Weinberg acknowledging the findings of this article].

In 1980 came the most important edition of all: Werner Jochmann, *Monologe im Führerhauptquartier 1941-1944: die Aufzeichnungen Heinrich Heims herausgegeben von Werner Jochmann* (Hamburg: A Knaus).

I have also stumbled across I.M. Fradkin's 1993 translation into Russian of Picker's version, entitled *Zastolnye razgovory Gitlera* (Smolensk: Rusich).

Gitta Sereny, in "The Truth Is, I Loved Hitler," *The Observer* (28 April 1996) mentions a serialization of the original German of Genoud's manuscript in an unnamed German magazine sometime in the 70s, which I could not confirm.

There is also Gerhard Weinberg, *Guide to Captured German Documents* (Maxwell Airforce Base, Alabama: Human Resources Research Institute, 1952). On page 55 it is noted that "Safe 5" contains item 6, a "box of miscellaneous Hitler items" including sub-item 4: "Führerhauptquartier, Jan 18, 1942, abends, 4 pages," which "concerns German domestic politics;" "Führerhauptquartier, Jan 24, 1942, abends, 2 pages," whose contents aren't described; and item 8, "Typed copies of the utterances of Hitler, 1942, under item 6 above" (file no. 52-178). In fact, item 8 contains copies of everything in item 6, plus: Jan 8/9: 9 pages; 16/17: 14 pages; 17/18: 3 pages; 18/19: 2 pages; 19: 3 pages; 20: 2 pages; 22: 2 pages; 24: 2 pages (all from 1942). I did not attempt a systematic collation, but I noticed many handwritten corrections aligning what was typed to what appears in

Jochmann or Picker. [Note that the authenticity of these pages may come into question upon completion of Prof. Nilsson's research, as explained in the afterword to this chapter.]

Those are the editions of the *Table Talk*. Now for the additional scholarship cited in this chapter:

David Irving, "The Faking of Hitler's 'Last Testament'" (<http://www.fpagesco.uk/Hitler/docs/Testament/byGenoud.html>); this is part of Irving's controversial "International Campaign for Real History," Focal Point Publications (www.fpagesco.uk/docs/Irving/FPhistory.html), but his account of his dealings with Genoud sound credible.

François Genoud, editor, *The Testament of Adolf Hitler: The Hitler-Bormann Documents, February-April 1945* (London: Cassell, 1961 [also Icon Books, possibly others]). This was republished in 1978 (Los Angeles: World Service) with an introduction by L. Craig Fraser. It also appeared originally in French as *Le Testament politique de Hitler* (Paris: A. Fayard, 1959) with a preface by H.R. Trevor-Roper and commentary by André François-Poncet. On the questionable nature of this document, see Albert M. Beer, *Hitlers politisches Testament: Die Bormann-Diktate vom Februar und April 1945: eine Fälschung? Überarbeitete Fassung eines Vortrages auf der Tagung der Zeitgeschichtlichen Forschungsstelle Ingolstadt am 10. Mai 1986*.

Ben MacIntyre, "Swiss Banker who Worshipped Hitler Commits Suicide," *The Times* (4 June 1996).

David Lee Preston, "Switzerland is Urged to Open its Files on Nazi who Financed Terrorists," *Philadelphia Inquirer* (19 March 1997).

Pierre Péan, *L'Extrémiste: François Genoud, de Hitler à Carlos* (Paris: Fayard, 1996).

Karl Laske, *Le Banquier Noir: François Genoud* (Paris: Editions du Seuil, 1996).

Karl Laske & Maria Hoffmann-Dartevelle, *Ein Leben zwischen Hitler und Carlos: François Genoud* (Zurich: Limmat, 1996).

Richard Steigmann-Gall, *The Holy Reich: Nazi Conceptions of Christianity, 1919-1945* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2003).

Claus-Ekkehard Bärsch, *Die politische Religion des Nationalsozialismus: die religiöse Dimension der NS-Ideologie in den Schriften von Dietrich Eckart, Joseph Goebbels, Alfred Rosenberg und Adolf Hitler* (Munich: W. Fink, 1998), esp. 286-300.

CHAPTER 13

IGNATIAN VEXATION

Originally published at Richard Carrier Blogs on
1 October 2008. Revised. Copyright 2008, 2014.

CHAPTER 14

PAULINE INTERPOLATIONS

Originally published at Richard Carrier Blogs on
1 June 2011. Revised. Copyright 2011 and 2014.

The scholarship cited in this chapter is:

Birger Pearson, “1 Thessalonians 2:13-16: A Deutero-Pauline Interpolation,” *Harvard Theological Review* 64 (1971): 79-94.

G.E. Okeke, “1 Thessalonians 2.13-16: The Fate of the Unbelieving Jews,” *New Testament Studies* 27 (1981): 127-36.

Philip Payne, “Fuldensis, Sigla for Variants in Vaticanus, and 1 Cor 14:34-5” in *New Testament Studies* 41 (1995): 240-50.

The online resources referenced in this chapter can be located at:

<http://www.richardcarrier.info/NTReliabilitySlideshow.pdf>.

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=I0z8CpFR_lw.

<http://vridar.wordpress.com/2010/01/05/taking-eddy-boyd-seriously-3>

CHAPTER 15

LUKE VS. MATTHEW ON THE YEAR OF CHRIST’S BIRTH

Originally published at ErrancyWiki.com.
Writing funded by ErrancyWiki.
Revised. Copyright 2006 and 2014.

The expanded version of the original research report that this chapter summarizes is available at:

http://ww.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/quirinius.html

The resources cited specifically in this chapter include:

Passages Cited in Luke vs. Matthew (in the order cited or employed): (click [here](#) to skip to scholarship cited)

Josephus, *Antiquities of the Jews* 16.270-81, 16.344, 17.6-7, 17.24, 17.57, 17.89-133, 17.221-23, 17.250-98.

Josephus, *Jewish War* 1.577, 1.617-39, 2.66-80.

Strabo, *Geography* 16.1.28.

Velleius, *Compendium of Roman History* 2.117.2.

Tacitus, *Histories* 5.9.2.

Cassius Dio, *Roman History* 54.28.2.

Additional Bibliography for Luke vs. Matthew (in the order cited or employed):

For the coins discussed, see the relevant entries in Burnett's *Roman Provincial Coinage* (1992), including the supplemental volume with corrections.

Mark Smith, "Of Jesus and Quirinius," *The Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 62.2 (April 2000): pages 278-93.

Jacques Winandy, "Le recensement dit de Quirinius (LC 2,2): une interpolation?" *Revue Biblique* 104.3 (July 1997): pages 373-77

Robert Smith, "Caesar's Decree (Luke 2:1-2): Puzzle or Key?" *Currents in Theology and Mission* 7.6 (December 1980): pages 343-51

Edward Dabrowa, *The Governors of Roman Syria from Augustus to Septimius Severus* (1998), where pages 17-35 survey the evidence and names of all the governors of Syria from 25 B.C. to 25 A.D.

The consulship of Quirinius is reported in surviving consular lists etched in stone (see the entry for him in Pauly, Wissowa, and Kroll, *Realencyclopädie der klassischen Altertumwissenschaft*).

Jack Finegan, *Handbook of Biblical Chronology* (1998, revised edition).

C.F. Evans, "Tertullian's References to Sentius Saturninus and the Lukan Census," *Journal of Theological Studies* [n.s.] 24.1 (April 1973): pages 24-39.

Lily Ross Taylor, "Quirinius and the Census of Judaea," *American Journal of Philology* (1933): pages 120-33.

S.R. Llewelyn, *New Documents Illustrating Early Christianity* 6 (1992), pages 112-32.

F. Kenyon and H. Bell *Greek Papyri in the British Museum* 3 (1907), page 125.

George Milligan, *Greek Papyri* (1910), pages 72-3.

Michael Rostovtzeff, *Studien zur Geschichte des römischen Kolonates* (1910), pages 305ff.

Klaus Rosen, "Jesu Geburtsdatum, der Census des Quirinius und eine Jüdische Steuererklärung aus dem Jahr 127 n.C.," *Jahrbuch für antike Christentum* 38 (1995): pages 5-15.

CHAPTER 16

MARK 16:9-20 AS FORGERY OR FABRICATION

Originally published at ErrancyWiki.com.
Research & writing funded by ErrancyWiki.
Revised. Copyright 2009 and 2014.

Passages Cited for Mark 16:9-20 (in the order cited or employed): (click [here](#) to skip to scholarship cited)

Eusebius, *History of the Church* 3.39.9.

Eznik, *On God or Sects* 112, quoting Jesus (first from Luke 10:19 and then from Mark 16:17-18).

Eusebius, *History of the Church* 3.39.14 and 3.39.7-8.

Irenaeus, *Against Heresies* 2.32.4.

Hebrews 6:2; 1 Corinthians 12:8-11, 12:28-30 (cf. Mark 5:23, Luke 4:40).

Justin Martyr, *Dialogue with Trypho* 39.

Tertullian, *Against Marcion* 5.8.

1 Corinthians 12, Romans 12:4-9, 1 Corinthians 7:8, 1 Corinthians 14, and Hebrews 2:4 and 6:4-6.

Hippolytus, *Apostolic Tradition* 36.1.

Cyprian, *The Opinions of 87 Clerics at the Seventh Council of Carthage Concerning the Baptism of Heretics* 37.

Didascalia 23.(6.8), or page 101 of the Connolly translation.

Aphraates, *Demonstrations* 1.17, 1.8.

Ambrose of Milan, *On the Holy Spirit* 2.13.(151) and *On Repentance* 1.8.(35).

Jerome, *Against Pelagius* 2.15.

Section 5.3.(14) of the *Apostolic Constitutions* as well as sections 6.3.(15) and 8.1.(1).

Hesychius of Jerusalem, *Collection of Difficulties and Solutions* in Migne's *Patrologia Graeca* 93.1440 (5th century A.D.).

Severus of Antioch, *Homily* 77.

Additional Bibliography for Mark 16:9-20 (in the order cited or employed):

John Christopher Thomas and Kimberly Ervin Alexander, "‘And the Signs Are Following’: Mark 16:9-20: A Journey into Pentecostal Hermeneutics," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 11.2 (2003): pages 147-70.

Bart Ehrman, *Jesus, Interrupted* (2009).

Bart Ehrman, *Misquoting Jesus* (2005).

Bart Ehrman, *The Orthodox Corruption of Scripture* (1993).

Helmut Koester, "The Text of the Synoptic Gospels in the Second Century," in William Petersen, editor, *Gospel Traditions in the Second Century: Origins, Recensions, Text, and Transmission* (1989), pages 19-27.

Daniel Wallace, "Inspiration, Preservation, and New Testament Textual Criticism," *Grace Theological Journal* 12.1 (1992): pages 21-50.

Except where otherwise noted I rely on the critical edition of the Greek text provided by Barbara Aland, Bruce Metzger, et al., *The Greek New Testament*, 4th Revised edition (1983). See pages 189-92 for the endings of Mark (and page 191, note 6 for the VLE, on which also see C.R. Gregory, *Das Freer-Logion* [1908]). This includes an apparatus distinguishing which endings appear in which manuscripts (hereafter mss.), although in other cases I have found the apparatus of this edition frequently omits variants that I have personally seen even in the mss. they attest to using, which means such omissions may also exist here (so we should not assume their apparatus is complete). A more (but still not entirely) complete apparatus is available in Reuben Swanson's *New Testament Greek Manuscripts: Mark* (1995), pages 264-71.

Wikipedia on "Codex Bezae Cantabrigiae."

William Lane, *The Gospel according to Mark* (1974), page 582, note 3

Wieland Willker, "A Textual Commentary on the Greek Gospels, Volume 2b: The Various Endings of Mark," 6th edition (2009) at <http://www-user.uni-bremen.de/~wie/TCG/TC-Mark-Ends.pdf>, which is part of Willker's extensive "Online Textual Commentary on the Greek Gospels" (<http://www-user.uni-bremen.de/~wie/TCG>).

The best discussion at Wikipedia is "Mark 16:9-20 in the manuscripts and patristic evidence" in the entry for "Mark 16" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mark_16)

William Farmer, *The Last Twelve Verses of Mark* (1974)

J.N. Birdsall's review of Farmer's book in *The Journal of Theological Studies* [n.s.] 26 (1975): pages 151-60.

Steven Cox, *A History and Critique of Scholarship Concerning the Markan Endings* (1993).

Bruce Terry, "The Style of the Long Ending of Mark," originally published as "Another Look at the Ending of Mark," in *Firm Foundation* 93 (14 Sept. 1976), but available now at <http://bible.ovu.edu/terry/articles/mkendsty.htm>.

For a general discussion of the principles of stylistic forgery detection see: Donald Foster, *Author Unknown: Tales of a Literary Detective* (2000) and Robert Eagleson, "Forensic Analysis of Personal Written Texts: A Case Study," in John Gibbons, editor, *Language and the Law* (1994), pages 362-73.

Randel Helms, *Gospel Fictions* (1988) and Dennis MacDonald, *The Homeric Epics and the Gospel of Mark* (2000).

Ezra Gould, *Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Gospel according to St. Mark* (1896), pages 301-303.

Paul Danove, "Determination of the Extent of the Text of the Gospel of Mark," *The End of Mark's Story: A Methodological Study* (1993): pages 119-31.

James Keith Elliott, "The Text and Language of the Endings to Mark's Gospel," *Theologische Zeitschrift* 27.4 (July-August 1971): pages 255-62.

David Trobisch, *The First Edition of the New Testament* (2000).

David Trobisch, "Who Published the Christian Bible?" *CSER Review* 2.1 (2007): pages 29-32.

Christopher Tuckett, "Forty Other Gospels," in Markus Bockmuehl and Donald Hagner, editors, *The Written Gospel* (2005), pages 238-53.

David Gowler, "The Chreia," in Amy-Jill Levine, Dale Allison, Jr., and John Dominic Crossan, editors, *The Historical Jesus in Context* (2006), pages 132-134.

Raffaella Cribiore, *Gymnastics of the Mind: Greek Education in Hellenistic and Roman Egypt* (2001).

Dennis MacDonald, *The Homeric Epics and the Gospel of Mark* (2000), pages 4-6.

Thomas Brodie, *The Birthing of the New Testament* (2004), pages 3-31.

Richard Carrier, "The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb," in Robert M. Price & Jeffery Jay Lowder, editors, *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave* (2005), pages 105-232 [referencing pages 163-64].

Paul Danove, *The End of Mark's Story: A Methodological Study* (1993).

Jerry Camery-Hoggatt, *Irony in Mark's Gospel* (1992).

Adela Collins, "The Empty Tomb in the Gospel According to Mark," in Eleonore Stump & Thomas Flint, editors, *Hermes and Athena: Biblical Exegesis and Philosophical Theology* (1993), pages 107-40.

Wikipedia entries on "Codex Sinaiticus" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Codex_Sinaiticus) and "Codex Vaticanus" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Codex_Vaticanus).

Both also have project websites devoted to them: see The Sinaiticus Project (<http://www.codexsinaiticus.org>) and The Vaticanus Project (http://www.csntm.org/Manuscript/View/GA_03).

H.J. Milne and T.C. Skeat, *Scribes and Correctors of the Codex Sinaiticus* (1938), pages 9-11.

Dirk Jongkind, *Scribal Habits of Codex Sinaiticus* (2007), pages 18-21.

F. Crawford Burkitt, *Evangelion da-Mepharreshe: The Curetonian Version of the Four Gospels, with the Readings of the Sinai Palimpsest and the Early Syriac Patristic Evidence* (1904), pages 215-17.

Wikipedia entries for "Syriac versions of the Bible" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Syriac_versions_of_the_Bible) and "Syriac Sinaiticus" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Syriac_Sinaiticus).

P.E. Kahle, "The End of St. Mark's Gospel: The Witness of the Coptic Versions," *Journal of Theological Studies* 2 (1951): pages 49-57.

Gerald Browne, "The Gospel of Mark in Fayumic Coptic," *The Bulletin of the American Society of Papyrologists* 13.2 (1976): pages 41-43.

Wikipedia entry for "Coptic Versions of the Bible" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Coptic_versions_of_the_Bible).

On the recent discovery of Codex P. Palau Rib. 182 lacking the LE see Kurt Aland & Barbara Aland, *The Text of the New Testament: An Introduction to the Critical Editions and to the Theory and Practice of Modern Textual Criticism* (2nd rev. editor, 1995), page 202, and Hans Quecke, *Das Markusevangelium säidisch: Text der Handschrift PPalau Rib. Inv. Nr. 182 mit den Varianten der Handschrift M 569* (1972).

Bruce Metzger, "The Ending of the Gospel according to Mark in Ethiopic Manuscripts," in John Reumann, editor, *Understanding the Sacred Text* (1972), pages 167-80.

Rochus Zuurmond, *Novum Testamentum Aethiopice* 1.2 (1989): pages 44-52.

Rochus Zuurmond, "The Ethiopic Version of the New Testament," in Bart Ehrman & Michael Holmes, editors, *The Text of the New Testament in Contemporary Research* (1994), pages 142-56.

Martin Bailey, "Discovery of Earliest Illuminated Manuscript: Revised Dating Places Garima Gospels before 650," *The Art Newspaper* 214 (June 2010), which transmits the findings of J. Mercier, "La peinture éthiopienne à l'époque axoumite et au XVIII^e siècle," *Comptes-rendus des séances de l'Académie des inscriptions et belles-lettres* (2000): pages 35-71.

C.H. Turner, "Did Codex Vercellensis (a) Contain the Last Twelve Verses of St. Mark?" *Journal of Theological Studies* 29 (1927-28): pages 16-18.

Kurt Aland, "Bemerkungen zum Schluss des Markusevangeliums," *Neotestamentica et Semitica* (1969): pages 157-80 [referencing pages 169-78].

Bruce Metzger, *The Early Versions of the New Testament* (1977), pages 312-13.

Wikipedia entry for "Codex Vercellensis" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Codex_Vercellensis).

Wikipedia entries on "Codex Bezae" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Codex_Bezae), "Codex Corbeiensis II" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Codex_Corbeiensis_II), "Vetus Latina" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Old_Latin_Bible), and "List of New Testament Latin Manuscripts" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_New_Testament_Latin_manuscripts).

John Wordsworth, *Portions of the Gospels according to St. Mark and St. Matthew* (1886), pages xxix-xxx.

Frederick Scrivener, *Bezae Codex Cantabrigiensis* (1864).

Bruce Metzger, *The Early Versions of the New Testament* (1977), pages 317-18.

J. Neville Birdsall, "The Georgian Version of the New Testament," in Bart Ehrman and Michael Holmes, editors, *The Text of the New Testament in Contemporary Research* (1994), pages 173-87.

Joseph Alexanian, "The Armenian Version of the New Testament," in Bart Ehrman and Michael Holmes, editors, *The Text of the New Testament in Contemporary Research* (1994), pages 157-72 [157].

The official website for the Armenian bible: <http://www.armenianbible.org>.

Ernest Cadman Colwell, "Mark 16:9-20 in the Armenian Version," *Journal of Biblical Literature* 56.4 (December 1937): pages 369-86.

Albert Edmunds, "The Six Endings of Mark in Later Manuscripts and Catholic and Protestant Imprints of the Old Armenian Version," *The Monist* 29 (1919): pages 520-25.

On the Gothic translation, see summary and bibliography in the entries at Wikipedia for "Ulfilas" (<http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ulfilas>) and "Codex Argenteus" (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Codex_Argenteus).

Bart Ehrman, *The Orthodox Corruption of Scripture: The Effect of Early Christological Controversies on the Text of the New Testament* (1993).

Kurt Aland, "Der wiedergefundene Markusschluss? Eine methodologische Bemerkung zur Textkritischen Arbeit," *Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche* 67 (1970): pages 3-13.

John Burgon, *The Last Twelve Verses of the Gospel according to S. Mark* (1871), page 126 (with the scribal notes translated on page 123).

Clarence Russell Williams, *The Appendices to the Gospel according to Mark: A Study in Textual Transmission* (1915), pages 367, 372-73, 392-95, 441 (and for ms. 274, cf. page 418).

Maurice Robinson is quoted in *The Encyclopedia of New Testament Textual Criticism*, entry for "Manuscript 304" (available online at <http://www.skypoint.com/members/waltzmn/Manuscripts1-500.html#m304>).

Bart Ehrman, *Didymus the Blind and the Text of the Gospels* (1986), page 6 (cf. pages 6-7 for discussion and references).

For a general survey of why Patristic evidence “involves the greatest difficulties and the most problems” see Bruce Metzger, “Patristic Evidence and the Textual Criticism of the New Testament” in Metzger’s book *New Testament Studies*, pages 167-88 (quoting page 167).

Gordon Fee, “The Use of the Greek Fathers for New Testament Textual Criticism,” in Bart D. Ehrman and Michael Holmes, editors, *The Text of the New Testament in Contemporary Research* (1994), pages 191-207.

Miroslav Marcovich, *Patristic Textual Criticism* (Atlanta, GA: Scholars Press, 1994), see “Interpolations” in the index.

Wikipedia entries on the “Western text-type” (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Western_text-type) and the “Alexandrian text-type” (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Alexandrian_text-type).

Wikipedia entry on “Diatessaron” (<http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Diatessaron>).

Adelin Rousseau & Louis Doutreleau, *Irénée de Lyon: Contre les hérésies livre III* (1974), volumes 1 (pages 64-67, 79-82, pages 144-48) and volume 2 (pages 128, 137-39).

Burnett Streeter, *The Four Gospels: A Study of Origins* (1953), page 124.

K. W. Kim, “Codices 1582, 1739, and Origen,” *Journal of Biblical Literature* 69.2 (June 1950): pages 167-75.

Wikipedia entry for “Didascalia Apostolorum” (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Didascalia_Apostolorum).

See “The Report of Pilate to the Emperor Claudius” at <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/text/reportpilate.html>, as well as the entire “Acts of Pilate” resource page there (<http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/actspilate.html>) and the Wikipedia entry for “Acts of Pilate” (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Acts_of_Pilate).

James Kelhoffer, “The Witness of Eusebius’ *Ad Marinum* and Other Christian Writings to Text-Critical Debates concerning the Original Conclusion to Mark’s Gospel,” *Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche* 92 (2001): pages 78-112.

D.S. Wallace-Hadrill, “Eusebius and the Gospel Text of Caesarea,” *The Harvard Theological Review* 49.2 (April 1956): pages 105-14

See introductions on Aphraates and Ephrem in the *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers* volume 13.

Carmel McCarthy, *Saint Ephrem’s Commentary on Tatian’s Diatessaron: An English Translation of Chester Beatty Syriac MS 709* (1993), page 289 (section 19.15).

Wikipedia entry for “Apostolic Constitutions” (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Apostolic_Constitutions).

CHAPTER 17

THE NAZARETH INSCRIPTION

Originally published by The Secular Web in 2000.

Copyright 2000 by Richard Carrier and Internet Infidels. Revisions copyright 2014 by Richard Carrier.

Passages Cited for Nazareth Inscription (in order cited): (click [here](#) to skip to scholarship cited)

Many passages derive from the *Digest of Justinian* which will be cited as *Dig.* For this I relied on the translation of Alan Watson (published in 1985).

Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 18.29.

Marcion, *Institutes* 14 = *Dig.* 48.13.4.2.

Ulpian, *Duties of the Proconsul* 7 = *Dig.* 48.13.7.

Ulpian, *The Praetor's Edict* 2 = *Dig.* 47.12.1.

Ulpian, *The Praetor's Edict* 25 = *Dig.* 47.12.3 (parts 2, 3, and 7)

Macer, *Public Prosecutions* 1 = *Dig.* 47.12.8.

Paul, *Views* 5 = *Dig.* 47.12.11.

Additional Bibliography for Nazareth Inscription (in the order cited or employed):

Norman Geisler and Ron Brooks, *When Skeptics Ask: A Handbook on Christian Evidences* (1990), page 206. The exact same paragraph appears in Geisler's *Baker Encyclopedia of Christian Apologetics* (1998), page 48.

Josh McDowell, *The New Evidence That Demands a Verdict* (1999). This is the 2nd edition of the original *Evidence That Demands a Verdict* published in 1972, revised in 1979. The Nazareth Inscription is mentioned in the 2nd edition, pages 244-245, section 9.6A.2B.1C; and in the 1st edition, page 218, section 10.4A.2B.1C. In both places the material is basically identical, except McDowell adds to his 2nd edition the quote I also reproduce from Geisler and Brooks (page 67, section 3.3A.3B.2C.6D). These claims have since become part of the Wikipedia entry for this inscription (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nazareth_Inscription).

Image, text, and discussion of the inscription can be found at F. Cumont, "Un Rescrit Impérial sur la Violation de Sépulture," *Revue Historique* [January-April 1930], pages 241-66.

F. de Zulueta, "Violation of Sepulture in Palestine at the Beginning of the Christian Era," *Journal of Roman Studies* 22 (1932), pages 184-97.

Fergus Millar, *The Emperor in the Roman World* (1977).

Andrew Lintott, *Imperium Romanum: Politics and Administration* (1993).

F. Wamser, *De iure sepulcrali Romanorum quid tituli doceant* (1887), pages 31-35.

Simon Hornblower and Antony Spawforth, editors, *Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd editor (1996), entry for “*infamia*.”

Barry Nichols, *An Introduction to Roman Law* (1962).

On what the facts laid out in this chapter would mean regarding the accounts of Jesus’ burial and allegations of his corpse’s disappearance if Jesus *did* exist, see my chapters on burial and theft in *The Empty Tomb*, edited by Lowder and Price (with http://www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/nazarethlaw.html#12 and http://www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/nazarethlaw.html#14 and <http://www.richardcarrier.info/Carrier--ReplyToDavis.html#corpses>).

CHAPTER 18

THALLUS AND THE DARKNESS AT CHRIST’S DEATH

This article first appeared in the *Journal of Greco-Roman Christianity and Judaism*, volume 8 (2011-2012): 185-91.
Copyright 2012 by Sheffield-Phoenix Press.
Reproduced with permission.

Passages Cited for Thallus (in the order cited or employed): (click [here](#) to skip to scholarship cited)

Mark 15.33; Matthew 27.45; Luke 23.44-45.

Amos 8.9; cf. Matthew in 27.51-53.

Micah 7.8; Amos 5.20; Joel 2.31-32; Ezekiel 32.7-8; Isaiah 60.1-2.

John Lydus, *De Ostentis* 70a.

Herodotus, *Histories* 7.37.

Plutarch, *Life of Pelopidas* 31.3.

Plutarch, *Life of Aemilius* 17.7-11.

Dio Cassius, *Roman History* 55.29.3.

Julius Africanus, *Chronicle* 18.2 (as preserved in George Syncellus, *Chronography* 391 and 394).

Additional Bibliography for Thallus (in the order cited or employed):

Robert Van Voorst, *Jesus outside the New Testament: An Introduction to the Ancient Evidence* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000), pages 20-23.

Gerd Theissen and Annette Merz, *The Historical Jesus: A Comprehensive Guide* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1996), pages 84-85.

Jefferson B. Williams, Markus J. Schwab and A. Brauer, "An Early First-Century Earthquake in the Dead Sea," *International Geology Review* 54.10 (May 2012), pages 1219-28.

Felix Jacoby, *Fragmente der griechischen Historiker* (Leiden: Brill, 1954), sections 256 (Thallus) and 257 (Phlegon). For a translation and commentary of Jacoby's section 256, see Richard Carrier, "Jacoby and Müller on 'Thallus'," *The Secular Web* (1999) at http://www.infidels.org/library/modern/richard_carrier/jacoby.html. The passage quoted from Julius Africanus is presented and discussed by Jacoby in section 256 F1. I also reference section 256 T1.

Martin Routh, *Reliquiae Sacrae* (1814), II, pages 335-38.

Horace Rigg, "Thallus: The Samaritan?" *Harvard Theological Review* 34 (1941), pages 111-19.

Prigent, "Thallos, Phlégon et le Testimonium Flavianum témoins de Jésus?" in Frederick Bruce (editor), *Paganisme, Judaïsme, Christianisme: Influences et Affrontements dans le Monde Antique* (Paris: Bocard, 1978), pages 329-34.

Ida Miévis, "A propos de la correction 'Thallos' dans les 'Antiquités Judaïques' de Flavius Josèphe," *Revue Belge de Philologie et d'Histoire* 13 (1934), pages 733-40.

CHAPTER 19

ORIGEN, EUSEBIUS, AND THE ACCIDENTAL INTERPOLATION IN JOSEPHUS, *JEWISH ANTIQUITIES* 20.200

This article first appeared in the *Journal of Early Christian Studies*, volume 20, issue 4 (Winter 2012): pages 489-514.
Copyright 2012 by Johns Hopkins University Press
and the North American Patristics Society.
Reproduced with permission.

Passages Cited for Origen (in the order cited or employed): (click [here](#) to skip to scholarship cited)

Josephus, *Antiquities of the Jews* 18.65, 18.60–62, 18.63–64, 18.65–80, and 20.200-203 and 1.pref.5–10.

The analogous marginal note mentioned appears in Tacitus, *Annals* 15.44, evident in the right margin of folio 38r of Codex Laurentianus Mediceus 68 II, cf. *Codices Graeci et Latini Photographice Depicti* 7.2 (Leiden: A. W. Sijthoff, 1902).

Pliny the Younger, *Epistles* 10.96–97.

Tacitus, *Annals* 15.44.

Origen, *Against Celsus* 1.47 (ed. M. Borret, *Origène. Contre Celse*, in *Sources Chrétiennes* volume 132 [Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1967], pages 198–201; translation from *Ante-Nicene Fathers* volume 4, pages 800–801).

Origen, *Against Celsus* 2.13 (*Sources Chrétiennes* 132, pages 324–25; translation from *Ante-Nicene Fathers* volume 4, page 846).

Origen, *Commentary on Matthew* 10.17 (edition by Robert Girod, *Origène. Commentaire sur l'évangile selon Matthieu*, in *Sources Chrétiennes* volume 162 [Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1970], pages 216–19; translation from *Ante-Nicene Fathers* volume 10, page 702).

Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History* 2.23.20–21 (edition by G. Bardy, *Eusèbe de Césarée: Histoire ecclésiastique*, in *Sources Chrétiennes* volume 31 [Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1952], pages 86–90; translation from *Post-Nicene Fathers* volume 1, pages 206–209).

Josephus, *AJ* 20.203 (translation by William Whiston, *Flavius Josephus: The Second Jewish Commonwealth: From the Maccabean Rebellion to the Outbreak of the Judaeo-Roman War*, editor Nahum Glatzer, revised by A. R. Shilleto [New York: Schocken Books, 1971], page 519. I employ my own translations for other quotations from Josephus.

Clementine Recognitions 1.66–70.

Clement of Alexandria, *Outlines* 8, lost but quoted in Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History* 2.1.3–4.

Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History* 2.23.3–18 (*Sources Chrétiennes* volume 31, pages 86–90; translation from *Post-Nicene Fathers* volume 1, pages 207–208, modified; my emphasis).

Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History* 2.23.19 (*Sources Chrétiennes* volume 31, page 90; translation from *Post-Nicene Fathers* volume 1, page 208).

Origen's *Commentary on Matthew* (fragment 25), preserved in a twelfth-century catena [Erich Klostermann, *Origenes Werke*, volume 12 (Leipzig: J. C. Hinrichs, 1941), page 190, section 457 II]. This remark does not appear in the Latin translation of Origen's commentary, but this was probably a result of abbreviation; see Klostermann, *Origenes Werke*, volume 11 (Leipzig: J. C. Hinrichs, 1933), page 42. That the Latin often gives an abbreviated version of the original text (and thus such a loss of detail in it is typical), is explained in Hermann J. Vogt, *Origenes. Der Kommentar zum Evangelium nach Mattäus III* (Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1993), pages 1–8, with the remarks in C. page Bammel's review of same in *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 46 (1995): pages 549–50.

Clementine Homilies 18.4.5.

Justin Martyr, *Apology* 1.30.1.

Justin Martyr, *Dialogue with Trypho* 32.1.

Origen, *Against Celsus* pref.2.12.

Origen, *Commentary on the Gospel of John* 1.5.29, 1.21.126, 13.26.title.

Origen, *Series of Commentaries on the Gospel of Matthew* 255.

Origen, *Scholia on Matthew* 17.308.

Origen, *Homilies on Jeremiah* 16.10.

Origen, *Against Celsus* 4.28.

Additional Bibliography for Origen (in the order cited or employed):

James Carleton Paget, "Some Observations on Josephus and Christianity," *Journal of Theological Studies* 52 (2001): pages 539–624. Pages 546–54 discuss the scholarship on the passage in *AJ* 20.200 specifically.

Alice Whealey, *Josephus on Jesus: The Testimonium Flavianum Controversy from Late Antiquity to Modern Times* (New York: Peter Lang, 2003).

Robert Van Voorst, *Jesus Outside the New Testament: An Introduction to the Ancient Evidence* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 2000), pages 81–104.

G.A. Wells, *Did Jesus Exist?* (Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 1975), page 11.

K.A. Olson, "Eusebius and the Testimonium Flavianum," *Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 61 (1999): pages 305–22, referencing page 315.

F.W. Hall, *A Companion to Classical Texts* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1913), 193–97, quoted at 194.

Robert Renehan, *Greek Textual Criticism: A Reader* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1969), 36 (section 32).

Miroslav Marcovich, *Patristic Textual Criticism* (Atlanta, GA: Scholars Press, 1994), the entry for "Interpolations" in the index.

Paul Maas, *Textual Criticism*, translated by Barbara Flower (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1958), pages 34–35 (section 33) and page 14 (section 16).

Martin West, *Textual Criticism and Editorial Technique Applicable to Greek and Latin Texts* (Stuttgart: B. G. Teubner, 1973), page 28.

Richard Carrier, "Scribal Error and the Destruction of the Library of Alexandria," unpublished paper delivered at the Repetition and Error conference sponsored by the Department of Classics, University of California at Berkeley, on March 12, 2005.

Andrew Carriker, *The Library of Eusebius of Caesarea* (Boston: Brill, 2003).

Alice Whealey, "The Testimonium Flavianum in Syriac and Arabic," *New Testament Studies* 54 (2008): pages 573–90.

Alice Whealey, "Josephus, Eusebius of Caesarea, and the Testimonium Flavianum," in *Josephus und das Neue Testament: Wechselseitige Wahrnehmungen*, editors Christfried Böttrich and Jens Herzer (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2007), pages 73–116.

Ken Olson, "A Eusebian Reading of the Testimonium Flavianum," in *Eusebius of Caesarea: Tradition and Innovations* (Harvard University Press, 2013), pages 97–114, supplemented by Ken Olson, "The Testimonium Flavianum, Eusebius, and Consensus," *The Jesus Blog* (13 August 2013) at <http://historicaljesusresearch.blogspot.com/2013/08/the-testimonium-flavianum-eusebius-and.html>.

G.J. Goldberg, "The Coincidences of the Testimonium of Josephus and the Emmaus Narrative of Luke," *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 13 (1995): pages 59–77.

Benedikt Niese, *Flavii Iosephi opera* (Berlin: Weidmann, 1892), 4:310.

Richard Carrier, *Proving History: Bayes's Theorem and the Quest for the Historical Jesus* (Amherst, NY: Prometheus, 2012).

Richard Pervo, *Dating Acts: Between the Evangelists and the Apologists* (Santa Rosa, CA: Polebridge Press, 2006).

Richard Pervo, *The Mystery of Acts* (Santa Rosa, CA: Polebridge, 2008).

Richard Pervo, *Acts: A Commentary* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2009).

David Trobisch, "Who Published the Christian Bible?" *Committee for the Scientific Examination of Religion Review* 2 (2007): pages 29–32.

Steve Mason, *Josephus and the New Testament* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1992), pages 185–229.

Heinz Schreckenberg, "Flavius Josephus und die lukanischen Schriften," in *Wort in der Zeit: Neutestamentliche Studien: Festgabe für Karl Heinrich Rengstorf zum 75. Geburtstag*, editor Wilfrid Haubeck and Michael Bachmann (Leiden: Brill, 1980), pages 179–209.

Max Krenkel, *Josephus und Lucas: Der schriftstellerische Einfluss des jüdischen Geschichtschreibers auf den christlichen* (Leipzig: H. Haessel, 1894).

G.J. Goldberg, "The Josephus-Luke Connection," *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 13 (1995): pages 59–77.

Hans-Josef Klauck, *Magic and Paganism in Early Christianity: The World of the Acts of the Apostles* (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 2000), pages 41–43.

Heinz Schreckenberg, *Jewish Historiography and Iconography in Early and Medieval Christianity* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1992), volume 1, pages 42–53.

Gregory Sterling, *Historiography and Self-Definition: Josephos, Luke-Acts, and Apologetic Historiography* (Leiden: Brill, 1992), pages 365–69.

CHAPTER 20

THE PROSPECT OF A CHRISTIAN INTERPOLATION IN TACITUS, *ANNALS* 15.44

This article appeared in *Vigiliae Christianae*, volume 68 (2014): pages 1-20.

Copyright 2014 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden.

Reproduced with permission.

Passages Cited in Prospect (in the order cited or employed): (click [here](#) to skip to scholarship cited)

Tacitus, *Annals* 15.44.

Interpolation examples: Mark 7:16, 9:44, 9:46, 11:26, 16:9-20; Matthew 12:47, 17:21, 18:10, 21:44, 27:49b; Luke 17:36, 22:43-44, 23:17, 23:34a; John 5:4, 7:53-8:11; Acts 8:37, 15:34, 28:29; Romans 16:24.

Pliny, *Letters* 10.96.

Evidence cited for Pliny and Tacitus's relationship can be found in: Pliny the Younger, *Letters* 6.16; 6.20, 7.33; 2.11.2; 6.9; 1.6, 4.15.1, and 7.20.6; 2.1.6; 9.23.2; 4.13; 1.20; 9.14; 9.10; 7.20 and 8.7; 6.16.22; 7.20.2; 7.20.7).

Tacitus, *Annals* 13.20, 15.61.

Tacitus, *Agricola* 10.3.

Tacitus, *Annals* 1.69, 13.20, 15.53.

Tacitus, *Histories* 3.29.

Pliny the Younger, *Letters* 6.16.

Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 17.1.5.

Suetonius, *Nero* 16.2.

Suetonius, *Claudius* 25.4.

Dio Cassius, *Roman History* 60.6.6 (translation by Earnest Cary, Loeb Classics edition).

Orosius, *A History against the Pagans* 7.6.15-16.

Acts 18:2.

Tacitus, *Annals* 2.61 and 4.4-5.

Sulpicius Severus, *Chronicle* 2.30.6-7.

Orosius, *History against the Pagans* 7.9.4-6.

Pliny the Younger, *Letters* 10.96-97; cf. 10.34.

Acts 18:12-17, 23:26-35, 26:24-32.

Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities* 18.63-64.

Dio Cassius, *Roman History* 62.16-18.

Pliny the Elder, *Natural History* 17.1.5.

Acts of Paul 11:3.

Tertullian, *Apology* 16 and 5.3 and 21.25.

Tertullian, *Ad Nationes* 1.11 and 2.12 and 1.7.8.

Tertullian, *Antidote for the Scorpion's Sting* 15.

Eusebius, *History of the Church* 2.25; cf. also 2.22, 3.1, and 4.26

Lactantius, *On the Manner in Which the Persecutors Died* 3 (translation by William Fletcher, *Ante-Nicene Fathers* edition).

Lactantius, *On the Manner in Which the Persecutors Died* 14-15 (translation by William Fletcher, *Ante-Nicene Fathers* edition).

Eusebius, *History of the Church* 8.6.

1 Clement 5 and 6 and 1:1.

Sibylline Oracles 5.140-46.

Ascension of Isaiah 3:13-4:22.

Revelation 8 and 7 through 19, especially 17:10-11.

Irenaeus, *Against Heresies* 5.30.3.

Additional Bibliography for Prospect (in the order cited or employed):

Robert Van Voorst, *Jesus Outside the New Testament: An Introduction to the Ancient Evidence* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B. Eerdmans, 2000), pages 42-43.

Herbert W. Benario, "Recent Work on Tacitus (1964–1968)," *The Classical World* 63.8 (April 1970), pages 253-66 [see pages 264-65].

Herbert W. Benario, "Recent Work on Tacitus (1974–1983)," *The Classical World* 80.2 (Nov.–Dec. 1986), pages 73-147 [see page 139].

Jean Rougé, "L'incendie de Rome en 64 et l'incendie de Nicomédie en 303," *Mélanges d'histoire ancienne offerts à William Seston* (Paris: E. de Boccard, 1974), pages 433-41.

Earl Doherty, *Jesus: Neither God nor Man: The Case for a Mythical Jesus* (Ottawa: Age of Reason Publications, 2009), pages 596-630.

James Carleton Paget, "Some Observations on Josephus and Christianity," *Journal of Theological Studies* 52 [2001]: pages 539–624;.

Gerd Theissen and Annette Merz, *The Historical Jesus: A Comprehensive Guide* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1996), pages 63-124.

Bradley Peper and Mark DelCogliano, "The Pliny and Trajan Correspondence," in Amy-Jill Levine, Dale C. Allison, Jr., and John Dominic Crossan, editors, *The Historical Jesus in Context* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2006), pages 366-71.

A.N. Sherwin-White and Simon Price, "Pliny (2) the Younger," in Simon Hornblower and Antony Spawforth, editors, *Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd edition (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), page 1198.

"Tacitus (1)," in Simon and Spawforth, *Oxford Classical Dictionary*, pages 1469-71.

Stephen Benko, "Pagan Criticism of Christianity During the First Two Centuries A.D.," *Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt* II 23.2 (1980), page 1063.

Stephen Dando-Collins, *The Great Fire of Rome: The Fall of the Emperor Nero and His City* (Cambridge: Da Capo Press, 2010), page 6.

K. R. Bradley, "Suetonius, *Nero* 16.2: 'afflicti supplicii Christiani'," *The Classical Review* 22.1 (March 1972): pages 9-10.

J. Mottershead, *Claudius / Suetonius* (Bristol: Bristol Classical Press, 1986), pages 149-57 (Appendix 2).

E. Mary Smallwood, *The Jews under Roman Rule: From Pompey to Diocletian* (Leiden: Brill, 1976).

Harry Leon, *The Jews of Ancient Rome*, updated edition (Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson Publishers, 1995).

Leonard Victor Rutgers, "Roman Policy towards the Jews: Expulsions from the City of Rome during the First Century C.E.," *Classical Antiquity* 13.1 (April 1994): pages 56-74.

Richard Pervo, *Acts: A Commentary* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2009), pages 446-47 and 294-95.

Stephen Benko, "The Edict of Claudius of A.D. 49 and the Instigator Chrestus," *Theologische Zeitschrift* 25 (1969): pages 407-408.

Dixon Slingerland, "Chrestus: Christus?" in A.J. Avery-Peck, editor, *New Perspectives on Ancient Judaism*, volume 4: *The Literature of Early Rabbinic Judaism* (Lanham, MD: 1989), pages 133-44.

Harald Fuchs, "Tacitus über die Christen," *Vigiliae Christianae* 4.2 (April 1950): pages 65-9.

Heinz Heubner, "Zu Tac. *Ann.* 15, 44, 4," *Hermes* 87.2 (August 1959): pages 223-30.

Erik Zara, "The Chrestianos Issue in Tacitus Reinvestigated" (2009), <http://www.textexcavation.com/documents/zaratacituschrestianos.pdf>.

Robert Renshan, "Christus or Chrestus in Tacitus?" *La Parola del Passato* 122 (1968): pages 368-70.

Erich Koestermann, "Ein folgenschwerer Irrtum des Tacitus (*Ann.* 15, 44, 2ff.)?" *Historia: Zeitschrift für Alte Geschichte* 16.4 (September 1967): pages 456-69.

Josef Ceska, "Tacitovi Chrestiani a apokalyptické číslo," *Listy Filologické* 92.3 (September 1969): pages 239-49.

Charles Saumagne, "Tacite et saint Paul," *Revue Historique* 232.1 (1964), pages 67-110.

Charles Saumagne, "Les Incendiaires de Rome (ann. 64 page C.) et les lois pénales des Romains (Tacite, *Annales*, XV, 44)," *Revue Historique* 227.2 (1962), pages 337-360.

Eric Laupot, "Tacitus' Fragment 2: The Anti-Roman Movement of the 'Christiani' and the Nazoreans," *Vigiliae Christianae* 54.3 (2000): pages 233-47.

Roger Viklund, "Tacitus as a Witness to Jesus – An Illustration of What the Original Might Have Looked Like," *Jesus Granskad* (2 October 2010) at <http://rogerviklund.wordpress.com/2010/10/02>.

W.H.C. Frend, "Martyrdom and Political Oppression," in Philip Esler, editor, *The Early Christian World*, volume 1 (2000): pages 815-39.

Naphtali Lewis and Meyer Reinhold, *Roman Civilization: Selected Readings*, 3rd edition, volume 2 (1990): sections 51-52 (see also section 169 and note 37 in section 68).

Timothy Barnes, "Legislation Against the Christians," *Journal of Roman Studies* 58 (1968): pages 32-50.

Candida Moss, *The Myth of Persecution: How Early Christians Invented a Story of Martyrdom* (New York: HarperOne, 2013), pages 138-39

Edward Champlin, *Nero* (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2003), pages 122, 125, 178-200, with corresponding endnotes.

Oscar Cullmann, *Peter: Disciple, Apostle, Martyr*, new editor (Waco, Tex.: Baylor University Press, 2011), pages 71-157.

Dennis MacDonald, *The Legend and the Apostle: The Battle for Paul in Story and Canon* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1983).

Richard Pervo, *Dating Acts: Between the Evangelists and the Apologists* (Santa Rosa, CA: Polebridge, 2006)

Elaine Pagels, *Revelations: Visions, Prophecy, and Politics in the Book of Revelation* (New York: Viking, 2012), pages 20-21 and 31-34.

Bibliographic Appendix

GENERAL LIST OF BOOKS AND CHAPTERS BY RICHARD CARRIER

(with common abbreviations)

HHBC = *Hitler Homer Bible Christ: The Historical Papers of Richard Carrier 1995-2013* (Richmond, CA: Philosophy Press, 2014).

NIF = *Not the Impos1sible Faith: Why Christianity Didn't Need a Miracle to Succeed* (Raleigh, NC: Lulu.com, 2009).

OHJ = *On the Historicity of Jesus: Why We Might Have Reason for Doubt* (Sheffield, UK: Sheffield-Phoenix, 2014).

PH = *Proving History: Bayes's Theorem and the Quest for the Historical Jesus* (Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2012).

SGG = *Sense and Goodness without God: A Defense of Metaphysical Naturalism* (Bloomington, IN: AuthorHouse, 2005).

[TCD = John Loftus, editor, *The Christian Delusion: Why Faith Fails* (Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2010).]

TCD_s = Richard Carrier, "Christianity Was Not Responsible for Modern Science," *TCD*, 396–419.

TCD_w = Richard Carrier, "Why the Resurrection Is Unbelievable," *TCD*, 291–315.

[TEC = John Loftus, editor, *The End of Christianity* (Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2011).]

TEC_d = Richard Carrier, "Neither Life nor the Universe Appear Intelligently Designed," *TEC*, 279–304, 404–14.

TEC_m = Richard Carrier, "Moral Facts Naturally Exist (and Science Could Find Them)," *TEC*, 333–64, 420–29.

TEC_s = Richard Carrier, "Christianity's Success Was Not Incredible," *TEC*, 53–74, 372–75.

[TET = Robert Price & Jeffery Lowder, editor, *The Empty Tomb: Jesus Beyond the Grave* (Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2005).]

TET_b = Richard Carrier, "The Burial of Jesus in Light of Jewish Law," *TET*, 369–92.

TET_s = Richard Carrier, “The Spiritual Body of Christ and the Legend of the Empty Tomb,” *TET*, 105–232.

TET_t = Richard Carrier, “The Plausibility of Theft,” *TET*, 349–68.

WNC = *Why I Am Not a Christian: Four Conclusive Reasons to Reject the Faith* (Richmond, CA: Philosophy Press, 2011).